UNITED NATIONS DEVELOPMENT GROUP

UNDP

Empowered lives.
Resilient nations.

Consolidated Report on Activities Implemented under the Joint Integrated Local Development Programme (JILDP) in Moldova

Report of the Administrative Agent

Multi-Partner Trust Fund Office
Bureau of Management
United Nations Development Programme
http://mptf.undp.org

31 May 2013

PARTICIPATING ORGANIZATIONS

United Nations Development Programme (UNDP)

United Nations Entity for Gender Equality and the Empowerment of Women (UN WOMEN)

CONTRIBUTORS

Sweden

Table of Contents

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This Consolidated Report on activities implemented under the Joint Integrated Local Development Programme/JILDP covers the period from 1 January 2010 to 31 December 2012. This report is in fulfillment of the reporting requirements set out in the Standard Administrative Arrangement (SAA) concluded between the Administrative Agent (UNDP MPTF Office) and the Contributor. In line with the Memorandum of Understanding (MOU), the Report is consolidated based on information, data and financial statements submitted by Participating Organizations. The report provides the Steering Committee with a comprehensive overview of achievements and challenges associated with the Joint Programme.

- The main outcome of JILDP's assistance was the development of the National Decentralization Strategy (NDS) - approved by the Parliament of the Republic of Moldova on April 5, 2012. JILDP's technical support facilitated the formulation of decentralization policies in key areas of the reform: assignment of responsibilities, fiscal decentralization, territorial administrative structure, and decentralization of property (real assets), education, and social services, etc. Strategies and specific policy solutions were approved by the working groups and adopted by the line ministries, while ensuring draft legal amendments were submitted to Parliament.
- JILDP provided a number of local public authorities with the necessary management tools to operate more effectively in preparation for the administrative and fiscal decentralization. To strengthen the institutional capacities of the weakest LPAs, JILDP elaborated a multi-criteria capacity assessment methodology and applied it to 114 local and rayon/district administration, to be institutionalized by the Government. The 10 most deprived rayon center towns developed, and started the implementation of socio-economic development strategies based on human rights and gender equality, and subsequently improved basic local services targeting the most vulnerable. With JILDP's support a large, representative and apolitical LG Association - the Congress of Local Pubic Authorities from Moldova [CALM] was constituted. 80% percent of the newly elected local officials from the 2011 elections, learned about their responsibilities, local government functions and the governing legislation, through a nation-wide training program organized by the State Chancellery with JILDP's support.
- Women and men from the 60 JILDP pilot communities were mobilized and empowered to participate effectively in local development processes focused on community priorities jointly identified with LPAs. JILDP worked in pilot communities to create opportunities for men and women to influence local planning processes, local decision-making and accountability mechanisms. The programme also developed their capacities to make meaningful choices and express them through and in partnership with LPAs, in order to be truly empowered. The community mobilization for empowerment process was integrated with the LPAs local planning processes. This ensured that the Local Socio-Economic Development Strategies reflected the real needs of the communities, giving them at the same time true ownership over the results.
- 19 localities from the Transnistrian region and 11 from the Security Zone were assisted, empowering their communities to participate in local development planning, implementation and monitoring, and enabling local actors to deliver public services and upgrade the basic infrastructure. Support was provided to priority initiatives identified by local community members. The initiatives aimed to improve basic infrastructure and social services. A special attention was given to capacity development of the CSOs in subjects like community empowerment, as well as human rights and gender equality in local development. The training was adapted to the specifics of Transnistria region.

The Joint Programme uses a combination of parallel funding coming from Regular Resources (UNDP) and Other Resources (Soros Moldova) and pass-through funding modality for the SIDA contribution. The Multi-Partner Trust Fund Office (MPTF Office) of the United Nations Development Programme

(UNDP) serves as the Administrative Agent of the pass-through funded portion of the Joint Programme. The MPTF Office receives, administers and manages contributions from Contributor, and disburses these funds to the Participating UN Organizations in accordance with the decisions of the Steering Committee. The Administrative Agent receives and consolidates annual reports and submits to the Steering Committee.

This report is presented in two parts. Part I is the Narrative Final Report and Part II is the Financial Report as of 31 December 2012 for the pass-through funded portion of the JP. The Final Financial Report will be submitted in the following year according to the signed SAA and MOU.

PART I: FINAL NARRATIVE REPORT

Programme Title & Project Number	Country, Locality(s), Priority Area(s) / Strategic Results
• Programme Title: Joint Integrated Local Development Programme / JILDP • Programme Number: 00073891 • MPTF Office Project Reference Number: 00073891	Republic of Moldova *UNDAF outcome:* By 2011, vulnerable groups in poor rural and urban areas take advantage of sustainable socio-economic development opportunities through adequate regional and local policies implemented by LPA and partners. *CP outcomes:* 3.1. LPAs operate in a more effective and transparent manner; 3.3.Empowered communities and CSOs participate in local development planning, implementation and monitoring
Participating Organization(s)	**Implementing Partners**
UNDP UN Women	State Chancellery of the Government of Moldova
Joint Programme Cost (US$)	**Programme Duration**
Total approved budget as per project document: MPTF /JP Contribution from SIDA (pass-through): *6,607,040* Agency Contribution • *UNDP 590,000.00* Government Contribution n/a Other Contributions • *Soros Moldova 70,000.00* **TOTAL: 7,267,040**	Overall Duration 36 months Start Date 01 January 2010 Original End Date 31 December 2012 Actual End date 31 December 2012 Have agency(ies) operationally closed the Programme in its(their) system? Yes **No** Expected Financial Closure date: 30 March 2013
Programme Assessment/Mid-Term Review	**Report Submitted By**
Evaluation Completed ■ Yes ☐ No Date: May 2012 Evaluation Report - Attached ■ Yes☐ No Date: May 2012	○ Name: Narine Sahakyan ○ Title: Deputy Resident Representative ○ Participating Organization (Lead): UNDP Moldova ○ Email address: narine.sahakyan@undp.org

ABBREVIATIONS

APA	Academy of Public Administration
CoE	Council of Europe
CALM	Congress of Local Authorities of Republic of Moldova
CPA	Central Public Administration
CSO	Civil Society Organization
GE	Gender Equality
GM	Gender Mainstreaming
GoM	Government of Moldova
HR	Human Rights
HRBA	Human Rights Based Approach
JILDP	Joint Integrated Local Development Programme
KN	Knowledge Network
LGI/OSI	Local Government and Public Service Reform Initiative / Open Society Institute
LSED	Local Socio-Economic Development Strategy
LPA	Local Public Administration
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
PC	Parity Commission on Decentralization
RM	Republic of Moldova
SIDA	Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency
SC	State Chancellery
UN	United Nations
UNDAF	United Nations Development Assistance Framework
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UN Women	United Nations Entity for Gender Equality and the Empowerment of Women
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
WG	Working Group

1. Purpose

The ***development objective*** of the JILDP is to assist the Republic of Moldova to ensure that vulnerable groups in poor rural and urban areas take advantage of sustainable socio-economic development opportunities through adequate regional and local policies implemented by LPA and partners in a rights based, gender sensitive manner.

The ***Immediate Objectives*** of the programme are:

- To assist the Government of the Republic of Moldova to upgrade national legal, policy and advisory frameworks to support sustainable processes of development at sub-national level.
- To develop capacity of local authorities for rights based and gender responsive planning, budgeting, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of development initiatives.
- To empower rural communities and CSOs in target regions to actively participate in local development planning, implementation and monitoring and have better access to improved service delivery and community infrastructure.
- To ensure that the communities of Transnistria and of Security Zone are equally benefiting from the improved service delivery and community infrastructure through their active participation in local development initiatives.

While the JILDP applies holistic approach to programming tacking the challenges at all levels of the governance, it puts the human rights and gender equality issues in the centre of all its activities. Thus, at the policy level the programme focused on ensuring transparent, non – discriminative, inclusive and evidence-based policy making. At the local level the programme's key focus was on development of capacities of local authorities on rights based and gender responsive policy and budget planning and implementation.

The JILDP comprises four inter-related ***components***:

- Policy Advisory and Advocacy Component;
- Local Self-Governance and Participation;
- Community Empowerment;
- Transnistria and Security Zone.

The following ***outputs*** are planned for completion in the programme components:

- National legal, policy and advisory frameworks to support decentralization and sustainable processes of development at sub-national level developed;
- Capacities of LPAs in the target regions improved to plan, implement, and monitor in a participatory manner;
- Rural communities and CSOs are empowered to participate in local development planning, implementation and monitoring and local actors are able to deliver services and upgrade the basic infrastructure;
- Communities and CSOs in Transnistrian region of Moldova, as well as in the area of the security zone of the Transnistrian region, are empowered to participate in local development and citizens have better access to information and services.

JILDP builds on the priorities of the Government Programme 'European Integration. Freedom, Democracy and Wellbeing', as well as the National Development Strategy (2007-2011) and UNDAF (for 2007-2011), in which the condition of most vulnerable (including elderly, disabled, victims of domestic violence, women at risk and young people) and the need to extend development assistance to the Transnistrian region are identified as major concerns.

2. Assessment of Programme Results

i. Overview of results

- The main outcome of the JILDP assistance at the national level is development and approval of the National Decentralization Strategy. NDS provides the framework and a roadmap for improved local democratic governance and more accessible and better services including for the vulnerable. An institutional framework - led by the Parity Commission for Decentralization, the State Chancellery, and the Special Parliamentary Commission for Decentralization – was established and is capable to implement the NDS. The policy studies undertaken have provided important proposals to change legislation for increasing local decision making and fiscal autonomy, as well as decentralization of property. The proposals are in the Parliament's hands for their approval.
- At the local level 10 rayons and 70 local public authorities have developed their local socio-economic development strategies using a human rights based approach. The implementation of the LSED strategies has been initiated with UNDP grants and will continue with the own efforts of the communities. The LSED strategies are particularly representative of the needs of all members of the communities, since they were elaborated in tandem with a community mobilization for empowerment effort. The sustainability of the implementation is reinforced by the multi-criteria capacity assessment and the ensuing local capacity-building strategies, undertaken in the target local authorities.
- The gender mainstreaming and human rights-based approach was key in the both elaboration and promotion of the decentralization policies as well as in the implementation local development initiatives. This innovative approach aims to ensure that vulnerable groups benefit equally from the reform, while women and men enjoy equal opportunities and rights. Among other outcomes, the decentralization process in the Republic of Moldova seeks gender equality and promotion of human rights, social inclusion for the vulnerable or marginalized groups, and equality of opportunities and dignity for all.

Programme Outputs and Results:

Output 1. National legal, policy and advisory frameworks developed to support sustainable development at sub-national levels with a special focus on Human Rights and Gender Equality.

1.1 Capacity Development of the Government and relevant Parliamentary Commissions for policy analysis, formulation, coordination, implementation, monitoring and evaluation

As a result of JILDP's interventions, the institutional framework needed to initiate and coordinate the reform was created and consolidated gradually. The institutions leading the decentralization process are: the Parity Commission for Decentralization and its working groups, the Special Parliamentary Commission on Decentralization, and the State Chancellery.

The Parity Commission, created by the Government on July 5, 2010, is currently a functional, fully-fledged high level body, capable to lead and coordinate the decentralization reform. Composed of Central Government Ministers and LPA representatives on an equal basis, the Parity Commission was itself created after a series of public debates and consultations organized with the support of the JILDP.

The Special Parliamentary Commission initially created in May 2010, restarted its activity in 2011, and has become a key actor to translate the decentralization policies into laws. Receiving regular legal advice and permanent clerical support from JILDP, the Special Parliamentary Commission has lead the Parliamentary debate, organizing regular, well-documented weekly meetings, as well as public debates outside of the parliamentary offices - an innovative exercise for this body.

At the initial stage, ***5 thematic working groups*** (strategic, structure and operation of LPAs, decentralization of services and competencies, of real assets, as well as fiscal decentralization) created with the support of

JILDP ensured a comprehensive analysis of the local public administration system. These working groups, assisted by high level international consultants provided by JILDP, laid the ground for drafting the National Decentralization Strategy. After the NDS's approval by the Parity Commission, the number of sectoral working groups[1] was increased to ten, enabling the implementation of the reform in its main areas[2].

With JILDP's support, ***the capacity of the Department for Decentralization Policies of the SC*** to coordinate the development and implementation of the decentralization reform in an inclusive manner was strengthened. The Department for Decentralization Policies is responsible for the development, implementation and the day-to-day coordination of the decentralization reform. The SC was supported by a team of 6 international experts to conceptualize and then draft the NDS, and also received permanent legal advice from local consultants throughout the process.

JILDP also ***contributed to improved knowledge through learning from the international good practices***. This was particularly important during the first stages of the reform in order to raise the awareness, increase the understanding and knowledge of the main stakeholders, to initiate, design, and implement the local government reform. To achieve this, JILDP organized a series of study visits to Poland and Latvia for 32 representatives of the Parliament, central and local government, and NGOs, and organized 2 high-level international conferences in Moldova ("Models of the Decentralization Reform and Development of Local Autonomy", "The Decentralization Reform: from Strategy to Action"). The 2 events gathered about 200 participants and involved experts of the Council of Europe as well as independent professionals from Poland, Latvia, Romania, Czech Republic, Slovakia, Romania and Moldova.

To increase knowledge and understanding of the newly elected officials regarding decentralization and human rights and gender responsive local development, JILDP also produced and distributed nation-wide (12,000 copies in Romanian and Russian)***, the Guidebook for the Newly Elected Officials.*** The JILDP interventions resulted in improved knowledge and especially attitudes of the civil servants involved.

1.2. Policy development support through advice, analysis and research

The National Decentralization Strategy was developed and approved by the Parliament of the Republic of Moldova on April 5, 2012, with JILDP's persistent and consistent policy advice and support. During the conceptualization phase, JILDP offered advisory support to high level officials during the working session "Decentralization – an option or political commitment" – July, 2010 with the Cabinet of Ministers. A fundamentally participatory and inclusive approach was applied to the development of the National Decentralization Strategy. The first draft of the Decentralization Strategy was designed through a series of thematic sessions with the WG of the PC and public consultations with the representatives of the line ministries, civil society, international and local experts.

Similarly, JILDP continued supporting the participation of all stakeholders in the decentralization policy formulation facilitating a vast number of public debates of the draft NDS (19 public debates with local government representatives, and 3 with the civil society organised in collaboration with CALM and the National Council for Participation). The opinion of the local public authorities was also collected through a survey conducted by the State Chancellery. The input collected during the public debates and from the survey was incorporated in the final version of the National Decentralization Strategy.

JILDP's technical assistance facilitated the formulation of decentralization policies in key areas of the reform. JILDP employed international and national expertise to support the sectoral workgroups to analyse the problems in each sector, look into relevant international examples, and formulate the goals of the sectoral policies and the corresponding policy options. The most important outputs achieved in respect of the sectoral decentralization policies are the following:

[1] Additional sectoral working groups on decentralisation in the education, social services, health, environment, communal services, e-government fields and a working group on the status of the Chisinau municipum were created during 2011.

[2] The sectoral working groups are comprised of the representatives of central and local public administration, think tanks, civil society, local and international experts

- ***The fiscal decentralization policies*** were formulated following a complex simulation and ample analysis. The workgroup on fiscal decentralization and the Ministry of Finance approved policies regarding a new system of general purpose revenues, based on the sharing of the personal income tax and a formula based equalization transfer. The approved policy option triggered amendments of 4 laws covering local public finances.
- ***The sectoral strategy on property decentralization*** includes the analysis of the real estate decentralization related issues, the relevant international practices enabled an informed and documented choice of the policies on decentralizing public property, including the identification and registration of property, separation by central and local ownership, classification of property for public or private use, etc. The approved policies triggered the elaboration of a new Law of Public Property.
- ***The draft sectoral strategy for education decentralisation*** assigns the main responsibility for education to the rayon/district level and reinforces the per-student financing principle which leads to more equitable allocation of resources and school network optimization.
- ***The draft decentralization strategy for social assistance*** targets the creation of nation-wide needs and quality assessment systems and the strengthening of the current financing system for social services[3].

An important set of policy documents – as instruments for defining the sectoral decentralization policy documents and the general implementation of the NDS- were developed with the support of JILDP experts. More specifically, the ***Chart of local and central government responsibilities*** across areas of competence was elaborated following the review of a large number of laws during which the competences of all levels of government were identified and mapped. The **methodology for assessing the local governments' capacity** was also developed and approved with the assistance of JILDP experts. ***The concept of the municipium status*** was designed and discussed in three public debates and intends to stimulate the socio-economic development of urban agglomerations and to contribute to the overall development of their catchment areas. The debates on the concept of the municipium status also brought up opportunities for discussing the territorial-administrative reform, as the municipium concept can play an important role in the territorial administrative consolidation.

A significant JILDP effort was dedicated to the analysis, including from human rights and gender equality perspectives, of the current legislation, followed by drafting of ***amendments to 7 laws with direct impact on local autonomy and other 15 laws.*** The amended laws were debated and approved by all Parliamentary commissions.

1.3. Information sharing and knowledge on decentralization and HR and gender responsive local policies among all partners

The main stakeholders in the decentralization process improved their understanding and knowledge regarding the decentralized local government system, and HR and GE responsive local policies, through events and sustainable instruments built with JILDP's support. Additionally, JILDP contributed to the ***development of e-tools to ensure the continuing development and sustainability of knowledge and information sharing***. In partnership with CALM, the LOGINCee (Local Government Information Network - http:// http://www.logincee.org/)[4] regional database was incorporated into the CALM website, while the

[3] Both the draft decentralization strategy for education and for social services were developed in cooperation with UNICEF, by hiring a local and international experts, which assisted working groups in analysis of sectoral problems, policy formulation as well in the process of public debates.

[4] The Local Government Information Network (LOGIN) aims to promote the professional development of local government officials and their staff and to strengthen the capabilities of organizations that support the reform of public administration at the local level. LOGIN is doing this by facilitating the exchange of timely and useful information at the municipal, regional and national level throughout the countries of Central and Eastern Europe and the former Soviet Union. LOGIN fosters the exchange of experience and expertise on a wide range of local government issues. Information sources, in the form of case studies, best practices, reports, data, and training materials, come from throughout the region and from qualified institutions outside the region.

LOGINcee page on Moldova was developed in three languages – English, Romanian and Russian and updated with over 200 papers and relevant documents.

A sustainable tool for professional development- a training program on decentralization and HRBA and GE - for public servants and elected officials was developed in partnership with APA and piloted with 47 participants. The training program is meant to enrich APA's curriculum in the field of decentralization and is expected to be further included in APA's regular curriculum.

<u>Output 2</u>. Capacities of LPAs in the target regions improved to plan, implement, and monitor local development plans in a participatory, rights based and gender responsive manner

2.1. Support 10 target towns to develop and implement the socio-economic development strategies based on HRBA and Gender Equality principles

10 rayon-center towns in Moldova elaborated and approved their ***socio-economic development plans in compliance with human rights and gender equality principles***, with JILDP's technical assistance. For the first time in Moldova the process of socio-economic analysis and prioritization of development projects involved not just active local stakeholders (the local authorities, businesses and civil society organizations), but also women and men representing the most vulnerable groups.

An innovative ***Guide on Human Rights based and Gender Responsive Local Development Planning, Budgeting, Implementation, Evaluation and Monitoring*** was developed by a group of international consultants. The guide was used to train a large number of national experts, then published electronically and disseminated to both LPAs and NGOs specialized in the field.

The 10 towns were assisted to identify in a participatory way their development needs and to elaborate ***local socio-economic strategies***. The community groups prioritized the interventions after carrying out a community profiling exercise considering human rights and gender disparities. Subsequently, ***12 development projects were implemented****:* 3 rehabilitated public lighting, improving public spaces for over 20,000 people; 1 town extended the sewerage network to over 3,000 citizens; 1 town improved access to public institutions (hospital, school and kindergarten) for over 10,000 people; 8 towns improved their education facilities by renovating the schools, kindergartens and playgrounds which host more than 5,000 children.

2.2. Develop institutional capacities of 10 target rayons and their localities

After the 2011 local election, more than 9,000 of newly elected officials (out the total of 12,000) have been trained with JILDP's assistance. They received information and induction training in local public administration. According to participants, the training programme helped them to acquire fundamental knowledge on local public administration, the decentralization process, as well as the application of human rights and gender equality principles in local affairs.

A multi-criteria ***capacity assessment methodology*** was elaborated and an assessment of 114 local and rayon/district administrations was carried out. The results have been used during the analytical phase of the elaboration of the National Decentralization Strategy. The target local public authorities (LPAs) from the South, Central and North regions of Moldova were assisted to draft, approve, and initiate the implementation of their ***institutional development plans***. All these LPAs implemented their first organizational and institutional development priorities, and received grants for this purpose.

A number of important ***knowledge products to advance the understanding of the rights-based and gender-sensitive approach*** was produced**.** 5 internationally available Knowledge products on human rights and gender equality in decentralization and local development were distributed to the seventy pilot LPAs. The

documents were translated in Romanian and printed by JILDP to assist them in their daily operations and service provision.

• To further strengthen and increase the understanding of the LPAs regarding the fundamentals of the HRBA, gender mainstreaming and women's empowerment, JILDP organized ***10 awareness raising workshops on human rights, gender equality, gender sensitive local development planning and budgeting***, during which the LPAs of 10 pilot rayons/districts, 10 towns and 58 communities were trained.

2.3. Support for improvement of local public services and utilities management

A comprehensive Legal Assessment has been carried out to evaluate the legal feasibility and constraints for ***Inter-Municipal Cooperation*** initiatives in the Republic of Moldova. ***The capacities of local CBOs in the area of application of Inter-Municipal cooperation approach were strengthened***. 20 Moldovan experts were trained to initiate and facilitate inter-municipal cooperation initiatives during a 5 days TOT Programme organized by JILDP using the ***'IMC Toolkit Manual' elaborated by UNDP, LGI/OSI and CoE was adapted by JILDP to the national context and translated in Romanian***. The book was widely distributed to the Moldovan professional community and local authorities.

The First National Conference on Inter-Municipal Cooperation was organized. During the conference, opportunities and constraints for implementation of IMC activities were debated.

6 groups of communities succeeded to raise the necessary financial resources to ***initiate inter-municipal cooperation projects*** for water supply, waste management and rehabilitation of roads (from the National Fund for Regional Development).

A pilot IMC project in waste management has been implemented in Telenesti, with the financial support of Think Globally Develop Locally Project (implemented in partnership with UNDP BRC) aiming to create a national model for 'extending the existing public services to neighboring communities'.

The Chisinau Municipality was assisted to elaborate and launch the ***Information System for Urban Planning and Land Management***, which revolutionized the municipal urban planning service by allowing full transparency of the land management database (information regarding property rights, zoning and building permits).

2.4. Support for the Association of Mayors

The newly established National Association of Local Governments ***- the Congress of Local Authorities from Moldova (CALM) - achieved institutional and organizational functionality***: professional and skilled staff, internal decision making procedures, communication tools (web page, newsletter), fully equipped office and financial sustainability plan. These were achieved through JILDP support.

An internal consultation platform for CALM was developed to support the national decentralization and public administration reform process. Through 3 training events organized by Czech partners and attended by more than 20 representatives of Central and local public authorities, and a study visit to Czech Republic for 10 representatives, knowledge on good practices in the LPA Associations' involvement, promotion and support of in the decentralization reform has been acquired.

The Women's Network of Mayors was created as a part of CALM with JILDP technical support, capacity development, and advocacy efforts. Building on this CALM further adopted a Declaration, Statutory regulations, and an Action Platform of the CALM Women's Network.

The CALM Women's Network has successfully elaborated its advocacy and awareness raising campaign and deepened the partnerships between its members in the country as well as established sustainable relationships with the women-mayors and women local leaders' associations abroad.

<u>Output 3:</u> Rural communities and CSOs are empowered to actively participate in planning, implementation and monitoring of local development initiatives in rights based and gender sensitive manner; while local actors are able to deliver services and upgrade the basic infrastructure

3.1. Develop capacity and transfer knowledge on local development for community actors, taking into account human rights and gender equality aspects

A Guide on Community Mobilization for Empowerment was elaborated, to ensure consistency in the community mobilization and empowerment initiatives. The Guide played a key role in explaining and promoting the benefits of community mobilization across rural areas of Moldova.

The elaboration of 60 rights-based and gender responsive Local Socio-Economic Development Strategies was supported in JILDP's pilot rural communities. These strategies responded to the needs identified jointly with the women and men from the communities.

A series of capacity building events in JILDP pilot communities was supported. JILDP organized 86 training events and workshops on human rights based and gender responsive local development planning for mayors, local councilors and members of community groups of the pilot communities. A total number of 1429 persons were trained, out of them 66% being women and 52% representatives of the vulnerable groups.

3.2. Mobilize target communities for community-led rights based and gender sensitive development

71 community groups were established as a result of the CME process, of which 61 groups including representatives of vulnerable groups, and 8 groups composed predominantly or solely of representatives of vulnerable groups, including 4 groups established by Roma, and 3 groups established by elderly and/or disabled women and men.

A highly participatory and inclusive community profiling exercise was carried out and completed in 60 pilot communities. The exercise implied identification of human rights and gender equality concerns, in addition to demographic, social and economic analysis. The issues identified through the community profiling exercise served for the elaboration of the local socio-economic development strategies/plans as well as for mobilizing members of the communities and forming community development groups.

The members of the established community groups effectively participated in elaboration of **63 *Local Socio-Economic Development Strategies and community project initiatives***. They were able to advocate for the inclusion of their needs among the wider community priorities.

62 project proposals on community initiatives were developed by local groups as result of the community mobilization for empowerment efforts, which were financially supported by JILDP. In addition at least 36 secondary projects were developed, of which 10 have been financed from external resources.

JILDP supported 9 communes to establish and equip Community Information Centers (CICs). The staff of the CICs was trained to ensure effective service provision targeting women, men and children from vulnerable groups. As a result, a wide range of information services was provided by CICs. Each of the 9 supported CICs developed a sustainability plan and received the commitment of the mayor and LPA for further support.

3.3. Support for human rights based and gender sensitive Local Development/community Programs

Over 57,000 direct people (52% women) from 60 communities have benefitted from improved services in their own locality, as the result of rights-based and gender-sensitive development.

62 human rights based and gender responsive community development projects were implemented, funded with 807,595 USD awarded by JILDP as grants. As an element of sustainability, all communities have contributed with funds to the co-financing of the projects. In total, the local contribution, mainly from local budgets, but also from rayon/district councils and other contributors has reached about 45% from the total cost of the projects.

Projects which aimed to improve the living standards, fulfill fundamental human rights of the entire community, target ***gender positive impact, and empower women and vulnerable people were supported***. The projects targeted improvement of conditions in kindergartens and schools (33 projects), extending of kindergarten premises to host more children. Through the JILDP funded projects 7 playgrounds and 5 stadiums, together with the necessary equipment for sport activities, are functional and in place. 10 Communities have new street lighting, 5 communities have improved road infrastructure, 5 rural communities have local community transportation service, 2 communities have improved public infrastructure and access to public services, 3 communities have clean water supply systems. Agricultural public markets for agricultural products are fully functional in 2 rural communities.

Output 4: To empower rural communities in the Transnistrian region of Moldova, as well as in the Government control area of the security zone of the Transnistria region, to participate in local development planning, implementation and monitoring and to enable local actors to deliver services and upgrade the basic infrastructure.

4.1. Mobilize target communities for community-led development

30 communities, 19 from Transnistria and 11 from the Security Zone were mobilized and empowered to develop inclusive, participatory and gender sensitive development plans. The local communities were assisted in participatory and gender sensitive monitoring and evaluation of local development initiatives. Training events on project writing and management were conducted for them. For the monitoring and evaluation processes, new data was collected and analyzed, using vulnerability disaggregated indicators.

30 community groups have developed their capacities and acquired abilities for elaboration and implementation of small local development projects, focusing on acute local problems of mothers, vulnerable families and children. During the implementation process, local groups were assisted by JILDP to include vulnerable groups in activities, improve the gender balance through affirmative actions and increase the access of vulnerable groups to local services.

As a long term result, ensuring sustainability, 2 initiative groups were registered as NGOs, and more than half of the ***community groups wrote secondary project proposals and are currently involved in fund-raising activities***.

4.2 Develop capacity and transfer knowledge on human rights and gender responsive local development for community actors

20 local organizations in TN have developed their capacities and already applied their knowledge and skills in community empowerment, gender sensitive local planning, project management and implementation, as well as gender mainstreaming. The NGOs have been participating in local development activities in target communities from TN, being involved in all stages, starting with local profiling and finalising with monitoring of small project implementation.

5 NGOs received technical assistance and were involved in local planning and projects' implementation through a series of training workshops on community empowerment and project management. These sustainable results were achieved conducting 2 ToTs and a final retreat training conducted by an International NGO (Ukrainian Women's Fund). The training workshops were interactive and participatory,

based on real examples from Transnistria, and using the Guide -"Gender Mainstreaming, Community and Women's Empowerment in Local Development Initiatives"- developed specifically for Transnistrian NGOs.

Regular Gender Equality coordination and information sharing mechanism for NGOs, Region's Health and Social Protection authorities and contributors have been established. By launching the quarterly GE Coordination Meetings in Transnistria, the JILDP aided representatives of the Transnistrian authorities, local CSOs, women's, other groups (single mothers, persons with disabilities, older persons etc.) as well as the development partners to create a sustainable coordination and information sharing mechanism on gender equality and women's rights. The regular meetings provide a good platform, which from 2013 will be taken over by the UN Confidence Building Measures programme.

4.3. Support the implementation and monitoring of local development initiatives

More than 25,000 people from the 30 communities benefited from quality local public services as result of the community development initiatives in Transnistria region and the Security Zone. They have improved access to healthcare, education, sport, public leisure activities services; public access to information through community centres, better opportunities to participate in local meetings, counseling, cultural and extracurricular education. These initiatives significantly improved community services on: education, sports, public leisure activities and health, facilitated and stimulated participation of people in local decision making processes, and in particular for vulnerable groups. The projects improved many of the time and resource consuming activities for the local people, such as contributed to ***creation of community centers to increase access to information*** (eliminating, for example, the need for a 40 minute travel by bus to obtain the necessary papers for the population), ***counseling, cultural and extracurricular education*** (by providing safe playgrounds for children which before were playing on the roads). The projects ***improved schools and kindergartens*** (window system, sanitation blocks in Shipca) and provided equipment and rooms/playgrounds for sport and cultural activities. The ***opportunities for children raised as well opportunities for their parents***, especially mothers that had to take care of the children most of their time, to gain access to information and have sufficient time to travel to nearby villages for work.

Cooperation and Partnerships

JILDP was born under the sign of partnership and cooperation, without which such a complex reform, touching a large part of the central government and all of the local authorities, would not be possible. Moreover, this kind of ***reform needs the support of the population and the civil society organizations***.

Partnership with Central and Local public authorities

During the project implementation many ***ministries and governmental agencies have been involved in a continuously expanding partnership***. A particular good relation has been established with the State Chancellery, the Ministry of Finance and the Ministry of Education. JILDP adapted its activities to the priority areas of the National Programme on Ensuring Gender Equality 2010 – 2015 through effective cooperation with the Department of Equal Opportunities of the Ministry of Labor, Social Protection and Family. The JILDP, through its Roma social inclusion and Romani women's empowerment initiatives, supported the implementation of the National Action Plan for Roma support (2011- 2015), thus contributing to the work of the Bureau of Interethnic Relations.

Partnerships with the 70 JILDP target communities in Moldova and the 30 from Transnistria and the Security Zone have been strengthened. A special partnership was established with the Congress of Local Authorities of Moldova.

Partnership with contributors

JILDP engaged in ***an active dialog with, and secured the collaboration of, other contributors*** for a successful achievement of its goals. JILDP has assisted the State Chancellery in organizing the first contributors' coordination meeting for decentralization and local governance.

JILDP continued its good cooperation with the ***Soros Foundation***. JILDP organized an international exchange visit for public officials, got financial assistance for strengthening of the legal framework for local financial autonomy, and has also commissioned directly a study on conflict of interest at local level, which influenced the provisions of a new law. ***UNICEF*** has joined JILDP's technical assistance efforts in drafting the decentralization strategies in education and social services. The International Conference "Decentralization Reform: from strategy to action" was also supported by UNICEF and the Soros Foundation.

The ***Council of Europe*** provided expertise for the conceptualization of the decentralization reform. It has been a major partner of JILDP in organizing the International Conference, and has brought several senior international experts to participate in the conference and provide review of the current policy proposals.

A partnership with the ***Czech Trust Fund*** to support CALM in building up an efficient platform for decentralization has been established.

A dialogue regarding decentralization and regional development is evolving with a number of bilateral contributors and embassies (USAID, the embassies of 12 new UE member, GIZ, etc.). For instance the JILDP products regarding IMC are widely used in the process of implementation of the ***USAID*** (through Local Government Support Program in Moldova) and ***GIZ*** projects of assisting local governments in improving municipal service delivery.

Partnerships with Civil Society Organizations

In the policy field, JILDP has partnered with the main ***think tanks*** (Expert Grup, IDIS Viitorul, IDU, etc) to carry out policy studies in fields like administrative and fiscal decentralization, territorial administrative structure, etc. The positive cooperation with the ***APA*** institution resulted in the successful implementation of the introductory training for the newly elected officials and the development and piloting of the training on decentralization for public servants and elected officials.

To ensure the most effective programmatic results JILDP involved a wide range of ***non-governmental organizations and community based organizations***. These organizations are especially valuable as they represent or assist those people experiencing inequality and discrimination on the grounds of gender, ethnic origin, religion or belief, age and disability. Thus, JILDP established sustainable partnerships for advocacy and capacity development with 35 organizations working on gender equality and women's rights, human rights, rights of Roma, older persons, and persons with disabilities, youth, as well as with the independent media, focusing on investigative journalism. In Transnistria, more than 30 non-governmental organizations and community groups participated in regular gender equality coordination meetings, while representatives of 5 CSOs took part in the TOTs on gender equality and local development.

ii. Indicator Based Performance Assessment

See Annex 1.

3. Evaluation, Best Practices and Lessons Learned

The progress in JILDP's piloting of HRBA in decentralization reform and local development received an overall positive feedback from a team of joint ***SIDA and UNDP Mission*** organized in May 2011. The

overarching purposes of the mission was to follow-up and consolidate prior and ongoing work on the partnership between the Swedish Embassy and UNDP on the integration of a human rights approach in the decentralization reform through UNDP/UN Women JILDP. During the mission's meetings with the national and international counterparts, and a group of selected CSOs, the achievements, gaps and lessons learned of HRBA piloting were discussed.

During the period of April-May, 2012 a ***Mid-term Review of the JILDP*** was conducted (see the Mid-term review report in Annex 2). The evaluation highlighted key findings and analysis of opportunities to provide guidance for the future programming, conclusions and recommendations, as follows:

- The National Decentralization Strategy is accepted by key stakeholders in central government, local government and civil society as the key document driving reforms that will ultimately improve services to the citizens.
- The JILDP technical support to the Ministry of Finance resulted in the elaboration of several options for fiscal decentralization with one of the options being selected and endorsed by the Ministry.
- Following the local elections in 2011, the Government with support from JILDP has organized a national training programme for newly local elected officials covering more than 9,000 officials. The Mayors reported that the training programmes helped them acquire knowledge in local public administration fundamentals, the decentralization process, as well as the application of human rights and gender equality principles in local affairs.
- CALM is recognized as a voice for local governments in Moldova and it has the potential to strengthen the capacity of local governments, both political leadership and technical specialists. The Network of Women Mayors created within CALM aims at enhancing women political participation, promoting equitable distribution of local development benefits to women and men, strengthening women's leadership, etc. JILDP was instrumental in these achievements.
- The Government of Moldova has been working to promote e-governance and ICT platforms to establish a robust service delivery mechanism. Successful pilot has been created with the support of UN WOMEN within Women's Economic Empowerment Programme in Moldova on establishing a network of Joint Integrated Services Bureaus (JISBs) in most of the districts of the country and a M&E system at the level of LPAs. JISBs have been highly appreciated and acknowledged by the Government of Moldova as efficient and functional model for delivery of public services locally. This approach has been further institutionalized and budgeted to cover the entire territory of Moldova. Such ongoing work should be linked to implement the newly approved decentralization policy and service delivery at the local level.
- The JILDP gender mainstreaming initiatives effectively targeted change in a number of issue areas identified by the UN Committee on Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) in their concluding comments (2006), specifically: introduction of gender mainstreaming strategy in public institutions, policies and programs supported by training; advocacy campaigns to enhance women's awareness of their human rights; measures to ensure that poverty alleviation programs are gender-sensitive and targeted at particular groups of women subject to multiple forms of discrimination(e.g. Romani, disabled, older persons).
- It is important to continue to build on the success of applying Human Rights based Approach and Gender Mainstreaming in the Decentralization Strategy by further inclusion of human rights and gender equality into local policies and activities. Human Rights-Based Approach and Gender Mainstreaming require sustained efforts over a period of many years for real transformational change to take place in both attitudes and practice.

Based on the findings of the Programme review, a set of recommendations have been provided which served as basis for the design of the new Joint Integrated Local Development Programme phase, as follows:

- Continue support in the area of policy, regulatory coherence, and sector strategies selectively.

- Critically provide support for fiscal decentralization for ensuring that the new strategy of giving responsibility to LPAs is supported by predictable resources.
- Set up a governmental system to implement and monitor the decentralization strategy.
- Support the establishment of e-governance for LPAs.
- Pilot inter-municipal cooperation projects and show the way forward for consolidation of LPAs.
- Using lessons learnt from existing approaches and models develop a model of vulnerability approach to community projects that can be easily scalable and replicable for the next phase of the project.
- Consolidate gender and HRBA models and concepts and incorporate it into all components of the next phase of the project.

The main **challenges and lessons learned** during the JILDP implementation are highlighted below and were taken into consideration while designing the new Programme phase**:**

- Since the decentralization reform is broad and deep, a common understanding of goals and outcomes, as well as sharing of values has to be built across all stakeholders. ***Sustained communication and dialogue with the population is needed*****,** so that the population buys in, demands and supports the changes, which sometimes are not obvious and may imply some sacrifices.
- ***Constant efforts should be directed to the institutional capacity building for decentralization.*** The assistance should be focused on building understanding among the main actors on the essence of the reform, built in mechanisms and the need to mainstream the HR&GE approach into the reform core actions. Exchange of experience from good international practices on decentralization can significantly improve understanding and change attitudes of public officials.
- ***Strengthening the administrative capacity of local governments***, reducing the territorial fragmentation, and optimizing the territorial-administrative division of the territory are fundamental pre-conditions for the successful implementation of the decentralization reform and its strategic objectives. Consolidated efforts with central authorities and development partners to promote and build IMC capacity are necessary.
- ***A human rights and gender equality approach in decentralization is a truly innovative, internationally recognized endeavor***. Successful implementation of this requires professional skills and support for the implementation team and the governmental counterparts, as well as internalization of key values and principles of HRBA and GE by key governmental staff.
- ***Community Empowerment is a central element for local development initiatives***. Developing a successful model of community mobilization for empowerment requires time-at least 2 full years. Strengthening capacities of local CBOs is a crucial element in ensuring sustainability of community mobilization for empowerment efforts.
- ***Considering the specific context in Transnistria, a tailored-made approach for communities is required***. Use of simplified community mobilisation procedures in identifying community development priorities, strategic planning, monitoring and evaluation processes will continue to be the main tools applied in Transnistria. A strong cooperation with other development initiatives in Transnistria is needed.

Given the stringent need to further advance with the implementation of the Decentralization Strategy, and building on the successful cooperation with the Joint Integrated Local Development Programme, the State Chancellery together with United Nations have designed a new Programme phase for 2013-2015 to support the implementation of the Decentralization Strategy at policy and local levels.

The Overall Objective of the Programme is to support better and equitable service provision and sustainable local development, facilitated by the improved legal and institutional framework resulting from the implementation of the National Decentralization Strategy. The Immediate Objectives of the Programme are:

- To support the Government in improving the policy and legal framework as mandated by the National Decentralization Strategy aiming at ensuring local autonomy, availability of resources, and more effective local management for better and equitable service provision.
- To improve the capacity of LPAs to deliver efficient, equitable and accessible local public services, to facilitate sustainable development and foster social inclusion.

Both areas of the Programme underline the national ownership and strengthening capacities at the local level to speed up economic recovery, reduce poverty and inequality, ultimately supporting the achievement of the MDGs. The Programme interventions will continue to apply a human rights-based approach, gender mainstreaming and women's empowerment, in line with national development priorities and MDG targets for 2015, while responding to the challenges of European Union integration driven reform.

PART II: FINANCIAL REPORT AS OF 31 DECEMBER 2012

2012 ANNUAL FINANCIAL REPORT

This chapter presents financial data[5] and analysis of the Joint Programme funds using the pass-through funding modality as of 31 December 2012. Financial information is also available on the MPTF Office GATEWAY, at the following address: http://mptf.undp.org/factsheet/fund/JMD00.

1. Sources and Uses of Funds

As of 31 December 2012, the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency has deposited US$ 6,607,040 and US$ 44,501 has been earned in interest, bringing the cumulative source of funds to US$ 6,651,541. Of this amount, US$ 6,577,431 has been transferred to two Participating Organizations of which US$ 6,522,412 has been reported as expenditure. The Administrative Agent fee has been charged at the approved rate of 1% on deposits and amounts to US$ 66,070. Table 1.1 provides an overview of the overall sources, uses, and balance of the Joint Programme funds as of 31 December 2012.

Table 1.1. Financial Overview (in US Dollars)

	Prior Years as of 31-Dec-11	Current Year Jan-Dec 2012	TOTAL
Sources of Funds			
Gross Contributions	5,206,636	1,400,403	6,607,040
Fund Earned Interest and Investment Income	14,543	943	15,486
Interest Income received from Participating Organizations	21,984	7,030	29,015
Refunds by Administrative Agent to Contributors	-	-	-
Other Revenues	-	-	-
Total: Sources of Funds	**5,243,163**	**1,408,377**	**6,651,541**
Uses of Funds			
Transfer to Participating Organizations	5,154,570	1,422,861	6,577,431
Refunds received from Participating Organizations	-	-	-
Net Funded Amount to Participating Organizations	**5,154,570**	**1,422,861**	**6,577,431**
Administrative Agent Fees	52,066	14,004	66,070
Direct Costs (Steering Committee, Secretariat…)	-	-	-
Bank Charges	66	20	85
Other Expenditures	-	-	-
Total: Uses of Funds	**5,206,702**	**1,436,884**	**6,643,586**
Balance of Funds Available with Administrative Agent	**36,461**	**(28,507)**	**7,954**
Net Funded Amount to Participating Organizations	5,154,570	1,422,861	6,577,431
Participating Organizations' Expenditure	4,293,503	2,228,909	6,522,412
Balance of Funds with Participating Organizations	**861,067**	**(806,048)**	**55,019**

Interest income is earned in two ways: 1) on the balance of funds held by the Administrative Agent ('Fund earned interest'), and 2) on the balance of funds held by the Participating Organizations ('Agency earned

[5] Due to rounding, total in the tables may not add up.

interest') where their Financial Regulations and Rules do not prohibit the return of interest. As of 31 December 2012, Fund earned interest amounts to US$ 15,486 and interest received from Participating Organizations amounts to US$ 29,015, bringing the cumulative interest received to US$ 44,501. Details are shown in the table below.

Table 1.2. Sources of Interest and Investment Income (in US dollars)

	Prior Years as of 31-Dec-11	Current Year Jan-Dec 2012	TOTAL
Administrative Agent			
Fund Earned Interest and Investment Income	14,543	943	15,486
Total: Fund Earned Interest and Investment Income	**14,543**	**943**	**15,486**
Participating Organization (PO) Earned Interest Income			
UNDP	19,933	7,030	26,964
UN WOMEN	2,051	-	2,051
Total: Interest Income received from PO	**21,984**	**7,030**	**29,015**
Total	**36,527**	**7,974**	**44,501**

2. Contributions

Table 2 provides information on cumulative contributions received from SIDA as at 31 December 2012.

Table 2. Contributions (in US dollars)

Contributor	Prior Years as of 31-Dec-11	Current Year Jan-Dec 2012	TOTAL
Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (SIDA)	5,206,636	1,400,403	6,607,040
Total	**5,206,636**	**1,400,403**	**6,607,040**

3. Transfer of Funds

Allocations to the JP Participating Organizations are approved by the Steering Committee and disbursed by the Administrative Agent (AA). The AA has transferred US$ 6,577,431 to two Participating Organizations (UNDP and UN WOMEN) as of 31 December 2012. Table 3 provides information on the cumulative amount transferred to each Participating Organization.

Table 3. Transfers by Participating Organization (in US dollars)

Participating Organization	Prior Years as of 31 Dec 2011	Current Year Jan-Dec 2012	TOTAL
	Transferred Amount	Transferred Amount	Transferred Amount
UNDP	3,865,928	1,070,575	4,936,503
UN WOMEN	1,288,642	352,286	1,640,928
Total	**5,154,570**	**1,422,861**	**6,577,431**

4. Overall Expenditure and Financial Delivery Rates

All expenditures reported for the year 2012 were submitted by the Headquarters' of the Participating Organizations via the MPTF Office Reporting Portal. These were consolidated by the MPTF Office.

4.1 Expenditure Reported by Participating Organization

As shown in table 4.1, cumulative net funded amount is US$ 6,577,431 and cumulative expenditures amount reported by the Participating Organizations is US$ 6,522,412. This equates to an expenditure delivery rate of 99%. The term "Net funded amount" refers to funds transferred to a Participating Organization less any unspent balances returned by the Participating Organization to the AA.

Table 4.1. Cumulative Expenditure of Participating Organizations and Financial Delivery Rate (in US dollars)

Participating Organization	Net Funded Amount	Total Expenditure	Delivery Rate Percentage
UNDP	4,936,503	4,898,236	99.22
UN WOMEN	1,640,928	1,624,175	98.98
Total	**6,577,431**	**6,522,412**	**99.16**

4.2. Total Expenditure Reported by Category

Project expenditures are incurred and monitored by each Participating Organization and are reported as per the agreed upon categories for harmonized inter-agency reporting. In 2006 the UN Development Group (UNDG) set six categories against which UN entities must report project expenditures. Effective 1 January 2012, the UN Chief Executive Board modified these categories as a result of IPSAS adoption to comprise eight categories. The old and new categories are noted below.

2012 CEB Expense Categories	2006 UNDG Expense Categories
1. Staff and personnel costs	1. Supplies
2. Supplies, commodities and materials	2. Personnel
3. Equipment, vehicles, furniture and depreciation	3. Training
4. Contractual services	4. Contracts
5. Travel	5. Other direct costs
6. Transfers and grants	
7. General operating expenses	
8. Indirect costs	6. Indirect costs

Table 4.2 reflects expenditure as of 31 December 2012. All expenditures reported up to 31 December 2011 are presented in the previous six categories, and all expenditures reported from 1 January 2012 are presented in the new eight categories.

In 2012, the highest expenditure was reported on Equipment, vehicles, furniture and depreciation with an amount of US$ 758,903 followed by Supplies, commodities and materials with an amount of US$ 558,259. Indirect support costs are within range at 6.6%.

Table 4.2. Total Expenditure by Category (in US dollars)

Category	Expenditure			Percentage of Total Programme Cost
	Prior Years as of 31-Dec-11	Current Year Jan-Dec 2012	TOTAL	
Supplies, Commodities, Equipment and Transport (Old)	114,308	-	114,308	1.87
Personnel (Old)	1,331,638	-	1,331,638	21.77
Training of Counterparts (Old)	43,420	-	43,420	0.71
Contracts (Old)	1,863,429	-	1,863,429	30.46
Other direct costs (Old)	639,123	-	639,123	10.45
Staff & Personnel Cost (New)	-	371,041	371,041	6.06
Suppl, Comm, Materials (New)	-	558,259	558,259	9.12
Equip, Veh, Furn, Depn (New)	-	758,903	758,903	12.40
Contractual Services (New)	-	291,302	291,302	4.76
Travel (New)	-	46,681	46,681	0.76
Transfers and Grants (New)	-	8,457	8,457	0.14
General Operating (New)	-	91,381	91,381	1.49
Programme Costs Total	**3,991,918**	**2,126,024**	**6,117,942**	**100.00**
Indirect Support Costs Total	301,585	102,885	404,470	6.61
Total	**4,293,503**	**2,228,909**	**6,522,412**	

5. Transparency and accountability

The MPTF Office continued to provide information on its GATEWAY (http://mptf.undp.org) a knowledge platform providing real-time data, with a maximum two-hour refresh, on financial information from the MPTF Office accounting system on contributions, programme budgets and transfers to Participating Organizations. All narrative reports are published on the MPTF Office GATEWAY which provides easy access to nearly 9,600 relevant reports and documents, with tools and tables displaying financial and programme data. By providing easy access to the growing number of progress reports and related documents uploaded by users in the field, it facilitates knowledge sharing and management among UN Organizations. It is designed to provide transparent, accountable fund-management services to the UN system to enhance its coherence, effectiveness and efficiency. The MPTF Office GATEWAY has been recognized as a 'standard setter' by peers and partners.

ANNEX 1: INDICATOR BASED PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT

Outputs	Performance Indicators	Indicator Baselines	Planned Indicator Targets	Achieved Indicator Targets	Reasons for Variance	Source of Verification
Outcome: To create (1) at policy level an enabling environment in Moldova for democratic local governance and community-led development through a facilitative policy, legal framework and institutionalized participatory, accountable, equitable local governance practices; and (2) at community level self-sustaining processes of social, economic and environmental development.						
Output 1 **National legal, policy and advisory framework**	1. Institutional framework to lead the decentralization reform established and functional	1. Institutional framework is not established. No/or very limited capacity	1. Institutional framework to lead, coordinate and monitor the decentralization reform established	Institutional framework to lead, coordinate and monitor the decentralization reform established		* GD #608; 5.07.2010 * Minutes PCD * Parity Commission Working Groups' Minutes
	2. # of training events provided to Government officials, LPA, CSOs on decentralization and HR & GE based approaches.	2. No training provided to Government officials, LPA, CSOs on decentralization; No training on HRBA and GM provided. No HRBA and GE in Decentralization and Local Development methodology available; No disaggregated statistical data on HR&GE	2. 10 training events provided to Government officials, LPA, CSOs on decentralization, 6 of which include HR and gender-based decentralization and local development. HRBA and GE in Decentralization and Local Development methodology available.	* **12 training events** conducted including: - 4 Workshops/Trainings on the elaboration of the National Decentralization Strategy, human rights based approach (HRBA) and gender equality (GE) for high-level officials, core-members of Parity Commission Working Groups, academia and civil society. - 2 JILDP Strategic Planning Workshops with trainings on Decentralization essentials, HRBA and GE for key JILDP government partners and JILDP team - 4 specialized trainings on HRBA and gender mainstreaming approaches, HR and GE principles in decentralization and local development , HR and GE analysis of legislation for State Chancellery decentralization division, legal consultants working of the Special Parliamentary Commission on Decentralization & CSOs; - 2 trainings on HRBA and GE in Decentralization (Education and Social Assistance) for the Working Groups on Sector Strategies of the Ministry of Education and Ministry of Labor, Social Protection and Family. - Two study visits in Poland and Latvia (Decentralization and Local Autonomy Development: "Successful European Models for the Republic of Moldova" Study tours in Poland and in Latvia) for members of the Parliament, central and local governments' representatives and CSO's experts (32 participants – CBOs, CPAs and LPAs representatives) - PhD program "Management and structure of public administration institutions; public services" at the Academy of Public Administration under the President of the Republic of Moldova for one public servant from the State Chancellery with a key role in the decentralization reform. - One executive development summer school "The Intergovernmental Fiscal Relations and Local Financial Management" in Budapest, Hungary - one high level public		* Events' reports * Agendas * Lists of participants * Human Rights Based and Gender Equality in Local Development and Decentralization Methodological Guide

Outputs	Performance Indicators	Indicator Baselines	Planned Indicator Targets	Achieved Indicator Targets	Reasons for Variance	Source of Verification
Outcome: To create (1) at policy level an enabling environment in Moldova for democratic local governance and community-led development through a facilitative policy, legal framework and institutionalized participatory, accountable, equitable local governance practices; and (2) at community level self-sustaining processes of social, economic and environmental development.						
				servant representing the State Chancellery - Master II program "Local Autonomy and public policies in Europe" - one public servant representing the State Chancellery * Human Rights Based and Gender Equality in Local Development and Decentralization Methodological Guide elaborated.		
	3. Decentralization Strategy and Action Plan designed and widely consulted	3. No vision, strategy and action plan/road map towards the reform	3. Vision, strategy and action plan/road map towards the reform approved	Decentralization Strategy and Action Plan designed, widely consulted and approved		* Law #68, 5.04.2012 published in the Official Gazette from July 13, 2012
	4. # of debates and consultations on decentralization organized for different groups of stakeholders, including vulnerable groups;	4. No debates on decentralization organized in the past 3 years for different groups of stakeholders, including vulnerable groups;	4. 16 debates and consultations on decentralization organized for different groups of stakeholders, including vulnerable groups	**31 Public Debates, 5 International Conferences and 8 Public Consultations** conducted, including: **Debates:** - 19 public debates on the National Decentralization Draft Strategy with the LPAs; - 3 public debates on the National Decentralization Draft Strategy with the CSOs - 3 public debates on the Matrix of Competences in Education with the LPAs - 3 public debates on LPA administrative capacity assessment methodology with the LPAs. - 1 public debate on the legislative amendments in the field of local public finance (amendments to the Fiscal Code and the Law on Local Public Finance) - 1 public debate "Decentralization Strategy Opening Opportunities for Women and Men Representing Vulnerable Groups: Roma" for representatives of ministries, local public authorities, CSOs, women and men from Roma communities. - 1 public debate "Decentralization Strategy Opening Opportunities for Women and Men Representing Vulnerable Groups: Older Persons" for representatives of central public authorities, representatives of local public authorities, CSOs, community groups of older persons. **Conferences:** - 1 International conference "Models of the Decentralization Reform and Development of Local Autonomy" (50 participants – CPA and LPA representatives, CBOs, international and local experts) - 1 international conference "The Decentralization Reform: from		* Events' reports * Agendas * Lists of participants

Outputs	Performance Indicators	Indicator Baselines	Planned Indicator Targets	Achieved Indicator Targets	Reasons for Variance	Source of Verification
Outcome: To create (1) at policy level an enabling environment in Moldova for democratic local governance and community-led development through a facilitative policy, legal framework and institutionalized participatory, accountable, equitable local governance practices; and (2) at community level self-sustaining processes of social, economic and environmental development.						
				Strategy to Action" (150 participants – CPA and LPA representatives, members of Parliament, international experts, community groups and CBOs) - "The UNDP Global Human Rights Community of Practice Meeting" in San Hose, Costa Rica (1 high level public servant from the State Chancellery) - One international conference "The Council of Europe Conference of Ministers Responsible for Local and Regional Government", in Kiev, Ukraine (2 high level public servants) - "The institutional and economic partnership as a chance for the sustainable development of the European regions", 8th Self-Government Forum, in Szczecin Poland (1 public servant from the State Chancellery) **Consultations:** - 1 public consultation on the first draft of the National Decentralization Strategy for Parity Commission Working Groups, representatives of line ministries, CSOs, international experts and development partners; - 6 public consultations on the JILDP studies in support of Decentralization Strategy for representatives of line ministries, Academy of Public Administration and CSOs. - 1 consultation on international experience on education sector decentralization for the school principals from Chisinau. - 1 roundtable "Administrative Decentralization in the Republic of Moldova – vision, problems and solutions" in partnership with the Academy of Public Administration		
	5. # of studies on decentralization aspects deriving from the Decentralization Strategy, including HR and Gender dimensions	5. No studies and analysis enabling the decentralization reform.	5. Minimum 8 studies	**19 Studies** on decentralization reform including: 1. Analytical study on optimal administrative-territorial structure for Republic of Moldova 2. Local public finance through the perspective of financial decentralization in Moldova 3. Report on Administrative Decentralization in the Republic of Moldova 4. Assessment of deconcentrated public services in the Republic of Moldova 5. Assessment Report Administrative capacity of local public administration authorities 6. Report on Local Government Finances. International Practices and Models 7. Report on Policy Proposals for Improvement of Local Government Finance System in Moldova 8. Intermediary progress report on Moldova Intergovernmental		www.decentralizare.gov.md

Outputs	Performance Indicators	Indicator Baselines	Planned Indicator Targets	Achieved Indicator Targets	Reasons for Variance	Source of Verification
Outcome: To create (1) at policy level an enabling environment in Moldova for democratic local governance and community-led development through a facilitative policy, legal framework and institutionalized participatory, accountable, equitable local governance practices; and (2) at community level self-sustaining processes of social, economic and environmental development.						
				Fiscal System. 9. Strategic Issues of Education Decentralization in Moldova 10. Policy Proposal for an Action Plan for decentralizing public property in the Republic of Moldova 11. Assessment of the property decentralization in the Republic of Moldova. Analysis of the current situation. 12. Assessment of the property decentralization in the Republic of Moldova. Comparative analysis of case studies from European countries 13. Assessment of the property decentralization in the Republic of Moldova. Administration of common spaces in the apartment blocks. 14. International Experience in Decentralizing Social Assistance and the use of Human Rights Based Approach. 15. Guide of Newly Elected Local Officials 16. Guide on the System of Public Administration Authorities of Gagauzia 17. Vulnerability Study "Taxonomy and possible decentralization policy implications for vulnerable groups in Moldova". 18. Sociological Study "Monitoring of Participation of Women and Vulnerable Groups in 2011 Local Elections". 19. Sociological Study "Access of Women and Men Representing Vulnerable Groups in Moldova to Services and Decision Making at the Local Level".		
	6. # of policy recommendations for improvement of the policy framework for decentralization;	6. Policy framework is not adequate for the decentralization reform.	6. Minimum 8 policy recommendations	**7 of policy recommendations** for improvement of the policy framework for decentralization, including: - fiscal decentralization; - property; - education (draft sectoral strategy on education decentralization; - social assistance decentralization (draft sectoral strategy on social assistance services decentralization); - municipium status; - 2 Conceptual Recommendations for State Chancellery on: Decentralization and Gender Equality; Decentralization and HRBA.		* Minutes WG on finance from 29.05.2012, 20.09.2012; * Minutes WG property from 04.12.2011, 22.02.2012; * Draft sectoral strategies for education decentralization and social assistance services decentralization.
	7. # of proposals for amendment of the legal framework submitted to the Government	7. Legislation on LPA doesn't include the HR and GE perspectives. New law on Local Public Finance	7. Legislation amended, including from HRBA and GE perspectives, law on Local Public Finance drafted and submitted to the	36 Legal Acts related to the Decentralization Reform, public finance, public property, administrative decentralization, and local public administration were reviewed in terms of compliance to the National Decentralization Strategy (including from HRBA and gender equality perspectives 72 amendments and changes proposed); Amendments and changes were elaborated and proposed to 26 of the reviewed Legal Acts.		* Bill of law № 343 for: 1. Land Code 2. Law on the Constitutional Court 3. Law on constitutional jurisdiction 4. Law on roads

Outputs	Performance Indicators	Indicator Baselines	Planned Indicator Targets	Achieved Indicator Targets	Reasons for Variance	Source of Verification
Outcome: To create (1) at policy level an enabling environment in Moldova for democratic local governance and community-led development through a facilitative policy, legal framework and institutionalized participatory, accountable, equitable local governance practices; and (2) at community level self-sustaining processes of social, economic and environmental development.						
		doesn't ensure the legal framework for decentralization.	Government.			5. Law on the normative price and the procedures for land sale and purchase 6. Law on the public communal services 7. Law on local public administration * Report of review and recommendations for amendments and changes to 21 Legal Acts *Minutes of the WG on Finance 3 from 20.09.2012
	8. Knowledge Network (KN) established and functional	8. No networking on local governance and development involving Central Government, LPAs, AAP, CSOs. Little attention paid to knowledge management, extracting best practices and lessons learnt. Actions undertaken are sporadic and not facilitated professionally.	8. Knowledge Network (KN) established and functional	Two knowledge sharing products were created and are functional on CALM website (the LOGINCee regional database and a professional networking tool); * Knowledge Product "Human Rights Based Approach, Gender Mainstreaming and Women's Empowerment in Decentralization Reform and Local Development.		http://calm.md/index.php?option=com_wrapper&view=wrapper&Itemid=165&lang=ro ; http://congresul.ning.com/
	9. Training modules in local governance and development including HR and GE dimensions designed and proposed to be part of Curricula at APA	9. # of trainings provided to Governmental officials, LPAs, CSOs on decentralization. No curricula in APA on decentralization issues including HR and GE	9. Training modules on decentralization elaborated for the Curricula at APA, including HRBA and GM into local governance	One training module on decentralization and HRBA and GM in local governance elaborated and piloted by APA, for the APA curriculum		Training materials and agendas for the ToT and the piloting sessions, lists of participants to the ToT and the piloting sessions

Outputs	Performance Indicators	Indicator Baselines	Planned Indicator Targets	Achieved Indicator Targets	Reasons for Variance	Source of Verification
Outcome: To create (1) at policy level an enabling environment in Moldova for democratic local governance and community-led development through a facilitative policy, legal framework and institutionalized participatory, accountable, equitable local governance practices; and (2) at community level self-sustaining processes of social, economic and environmental development.						
		dimensions.				
	10. Communication and awareness raising strategy on human rights and gender responsive decentralization reform designed	10. No communication strategy for the decentralization reform	10. Communication and awareness raising strategy on human rights and gender responsive decentralization reform designed	Communication Strategy of the Decentralization Reform elaborated, approved by the Department of Decentralization Policies and submitted to the Government Communication and Media Relation Department.		www.decentralization.gov.md
	11. # of awareness raising and advocacy events on HR and gender responsive decentralization reform	11. # of awareness raising and advocacy events on HR and gender responsive decentralization reform# of awareness raising and advocacy events on HR and gender responsive decentralization reform	11. Annual awareness raising and advocacy campaigns on human rights and gender responsive decentralization reform conducted.	* Government Decentralization Reform web-site www.descentralizare.gov.md created & regularly updated; * 58 news releases posted on the websites and distributed to the mass-media; * 60 thematic radio programmes on various aspects of decentralization organized at Radio Europa Libera, Vocea Basarabiei, Radio Moldova; * 82 thematic articles and news published in national newspapers: Timpul; Jurnal de Chisinau; Functionarul Public; Ziarul de Garda; 14 local newspapers - Cuvântul, Cuvântul Liber, Ecoul Nostru, Est Curier, Expresul, Gazeta de Sud, Gazeta de Vest, Glasul Natiunii, Glia Drochiana, Novaia Gazeta, Observatorul de Nord, Ora Locala, Spros i Predlojenie, Unghiul; * 30 thematic TV shows organized at Aici TV, Publika TV, Moldova1, Jurnal TV, TV7, Pro TV; * 5 press trips/media debates were organized in a target locality of the Programme: Ciuciuleni, Telenesti district (03.09.2012); Festelita, Stefan Voda district(28.08.2012); Ciulicani, Nisporeni district (25.06.2012); Nisporeni (24.10.2012), Suhuluceni,Telenesti district(30.01.2012). * A contest for journalist on “Decentralization reform in mass media” organized. * "Who is missing from Local Development?" Brochure and 5 posters; * 13 Photo exhibitions, including 3 on "Vulnerable Groups in the Context of Decentralization"; 6 dedicated to the International Roma Day, International Day of Older People, UN Day, International Human Rights Day; 4 dedicated to the International Roma Day, UN Day, International Human Rights Day; * 7 TV films on human rights, gender equality and vulnerability aspects of Decentralization Reform: “Local autonomy – better living conditions”; “Older persons of Moldova”; “The Role of		www.descentralizare.gov.md **TV films**: http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=nwWkjVmEiV8 http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=6YZH1oILYK8 http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=PnCLRoUN3dU http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=xVjgONiw05Y http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=bviQZj02JM8 http://youtu.be/zjOhwHTd4c0 www. undp.md **News in TV, radio & electronic media:** http://www.aicitv.md/ro/news/arhive/510/strategia-descentralizarii/listaction/arhive http://www.voceabasarabiei.net/rostul-zilei-cu-maria-bulat-saharneanu/24230-audio-rostul-zilei-10-octombrie-2012-cu-maria-bulat-saharneanu.html http://www.voceabasarabiei.net/antena-administratiei-publice-locale-cu-vrusu/22337-audio-vocea-

Outputs	Performance Indicators	Indicator Baselines	Planned Indicator Targets	Achieved Indicator Targets	Reasons for Variance	Source of Verification
Outcome: To create (1) at policy level an enabling environment in Moldova for democratic local governance and community-led development through a facilitative policy, legal framework and institutionalized participatory, accountable, equitable local governance practices; and (2) at community level self-sustaining processes of social, economic and environmental development.						
				Women in Local Governance"; "Discrimination against Romani Women in Moldova"; "Women's Network that resurrect villages"; "Community Empowerment - a Key for Inclusive Local Development in Moldova"; "HRBA and GE in the context of decentralization". *4000 leaflets "Joint Integrated Local Development Programme" in 3 languages printed.		administratiei-publice-locale-din-12-iunie-2012.html http://www.voceabasarabiei.net/stiri/social/21403-audio-primari-din-diferite-localiti-ale-rm-salut-iniiativa-parlamentului-de-descentralizare-a-autonomiei-locale.html http://www.voceabasarabiei.net/stiri/politica/21380-parlamentul-a-dat-und-verde-strategiei-naionale-de-descentralizare.html http://www.voceabasarabiei.net/stiri/politica/15751-premierul-vlad-filat-prin-descentralizare-autoritile-locale-vor-dispune-de-puteri-depline-dar-i-de-responsabiliti-pe-msur.html http://www.europalibera.org/content/article/24469692.html http://www.europalibera.org/content/article/24701700.html http://www.europalibera.org/content/article/24666361.html http://www.europalibera.org/content/article/24563198.html http://www.europalibera.org/content/article/24424953.html http://www.zdg.md/social/descentralizarea-posibilitati-pentru-cei-dezavantajati#more-52112 http://www.zdg.md/social/festelita-%e2%80%93-satul-in-care-a-inceput-

Outputs	Performance Indicators	Indicator Baselines	Planned Indicator Targets	Achieved Indicator Targets	Reasons for Variance	Source of Verification
Outcome: To create (1) at policy level an enabling environment in Moldova for democratic local governance and community-led development through a facilitative policy, legal framework and institutionalized participatory, accountable, equitable local governance practices; and (2) at community level self-sustaining processes of social, economic and environmental development.						
						descentralizarea http://unghiul.info/social/2268-descentralizarea-o-apropiere-de-cetean

Output 2 **Capacities of LPAs in the target regions improved**	1. # towns with approved HR and gender responsive Social and Economic Development Strategies	1. 0 towns have Social and Economic Development Strategies based on HR and gender impact analysis	1. 10 towns with approved HR and gender responsive Social and Economic Development Strategies	10 towns with approved HRBA based SE Development Strategies		*Decisions of approval of SE Strategies taken by Local Councils of 10 towns.
	2. # public debates with # of stakeholders by types (local institutions, CSOs, private sector, general population (50% women and 20%vulnerable groups) involved	2. 0 public debates involving 0 stakeholders by types (local institutions, SCOs, private sector, general population (50% women and 20%vulnerable groups) involved	2. 20 participatory public debates involving 600 stakeholders by types (local institutions, SCOs, private sector, general population (50% women and 20%vulnerable groups) involved	30 participatory public debates involving 640 local stakeholders, including 462 women (72%), 177 men (28%), 71 older persons (11%), 40 young (6,25%), 102 ethnic minorities (16%).		*Public debates minutes *Reports of the facilitators of the participatory process
	3. # of initiatives from Social and Economic Development Strategies implemented	3. 0 initiatives from Social and Economic Development Strategies implemented	3. 10 initiatives from Social and Economic Development Strategies implemented	11 initiatives from SE Development Strategies implemented		* Implementation reports
	4. LPA Capacity Assessment Methodology elaborated with JILDP support	4. Lack of LPA Capacity Assessment Methodology	4. LPA Capacity Assessment Methodology elaborated	LPA Capacity Assessment Methodology elaborated		Methodology Paper
	5. # of districts and # towns with Capacity development strategies approved	5. 0 districts and 0 towns with Capacity development strategies approved	5. 10 districts and 10 towns with Capacity development strategies approved	10 districts and 8 towns with capacity development strategies approved	JILDP Steering Committee decided to exclude 2 towns from the beneficiaries-	* Draft Strategies * Decisions of the Local Councils on strategies approval

Outputs	Performance Indicators	Indicator Baselines	Planned Indicator Targets	Achieved Indicator Targets	Reasons for Variance	Source of Verification
Outcome: To create (1) at policy level an enabling environment in Moldova for democratic local governance and community-led development through a facilitative policy, legal framework and institutionalized participatory, accountable, equitable local governance practices; and (2) at community level self-sustaining processes of social, economic and environmental development.						
					list	
	6. # of training organized involving a # of LPA representatives trained in the areas relevant for the decentralization reform	6. 0 training organized involving 0 LPA representatives trained in the areas relevant for the decentralization reform	6. 30 training organized involving 600 public servants trained in the areas relevant for the decentralization reform	55 training held for local public officials, including: * 10 training workshops on "Strengthening capacities of target Local Public Authorities in mainstreaming gender and human rights based approach in planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation activities" for 210 participants (65 mayors, district authorities and secretaries, 29 local councilors, 36 accountants, 58 social assistants, 7 NGO leaders and 5 media representatives); 131 women (62%) and 79 men (38%). * 15 trainings on gender mainstreaming in local governance for members of CALM Women's Network (100% women) - 202 mayors, 29 local councilors, 33 secretaries, 41 social assistants, accounts, and others. * two Study Tours (to Romania and Latvia) for 52 CALM Women-Mayors (100% women)+F17 * 30 training sessions on decentralization reform organized for 600 public servants *Study visit in Czech Republic within the project "Strengthening the Capacity of CALM", financed by Czech Trust Fund - 9 participants from LPA, CPA and NGOs *Training of Trainers Programme on Inter-municipal Cooperation to build local capacities (20 participants from NGOs)		* Training materials * Training implementation reports * Training attendance lists
	7. # of training and # of persons trained from LPA and other stakeholders (CSOs, private sectors, vulnerable groups) in local public services management	7. 0 training and 0 persons trained from LPA and other stakeholders (CSOs, private sectors, vulnerable groups) in local public services management	7. 20 training and 200 persons trained from LPA and other stakeholders (CSOs, private sectors, vulnerable groups) in local public services management	**348 trainings for newly elected local officials** held for 9,047 representatives of LPAs and local councils, including 5,971 women (66%), 3076 men (34%).		* Training materials * Training implementation reports * Training attendance lists
	8. # of IMC programs implemented	8. 0 IMC programs implemented	8. 10 IMC projects implemented	6 IMC projects implemented	Budget constraints	* Project reports * Report on "New perspectives for IMC in the Republic of Moldova" by Galina Bostan; *Guide on inter-municipal cooperation by John Jackson
	9. Association of	9. The newly-	9. One functional	* CALM - functional LPA association (600 members);		* CALM Yearly Reports

Outputs	Performance Indicators	Indicator Baselines	Planned Indicator Targets	Achieved Indicator Targets	Reasons for Variance	Source of Verification
Outcome: To create (1) at policy level an enabling environment in Moldova for democratic local governance and community-led development through a facilitative policy, legal framework and institutionalized participatory, accountable, equitable local governance practices; and (2) at community level self-sustaining processes of social, economic and environmental development.						
	LPA fully functional	created LPA Association lacks institutional, functional and organizational capacity	association of LPAs	* CALM Women's Network established and fully functional (113 women- mayors)		* CALM Membership (over 50% of LPAs) * CALM Women's Network Action Plan, Board Meeting Minutes; Annual Conference Report. * CALM Institutional Assessment Report *CALM Decentralization Platform *CALM Internal Consultation Regulation
Output 3 **Rural communities and CSOs are empowered to participate in local development initiatives in rights based and gender sensitive manner**	1. # of communities mobilized with Community Action Plans approved	1. 0 communities mobilized with Community Action Plans approved	1.60 communities mobilized with Community Action Plans approved	* 60 communities with Human Rights and Gender Equality Based Socio-Economic Community Development Strategies approved; * 64 community groups in 60 pilot localities established, trained, coached and mentored.		* Human Rights and Gender Equality Based Socio-Economic Community Development Strategies * Decision of Approval from the local councils; * List of established community group members
	2. #of public debates and # of stakeholders by types (local institutions, CSOs, private sector, general population (50% women and 20%vulnerable groups)	2. 0 public debates and 0 stakeholders by types (local institutions, CSOs, private sector, general population (50% women and 20%vulnerable groups)	2. 120 public debates and 1800 stakeholders by types (local institutions, CSOs, private sector, general population (50% women and 20%vulnerable groups)	**250 public debates** with 3916 participants, including 2559 women (65%), 1361 men (35%), 440 persons with disabilities (11%), 302 persons from ethnic minorities (8%), including 15 Roma (0,38%) 604 older persons (15%), 490 young persons (13%)		* Debates and meeting reports; * Agendas and lists of participants
	3 # of training provided to LPAs to # of stakeholders by types: CSOs, private sectors, 50%women and 20% vulnerable groups)	3. 0 training provided to LPAs to 0 stakeholders by types: CSOs, private sectors, 50%women and 20% vulnerable groups)	3. 120 of training provided to LPAs to 1200 of stakeholders by types: CSOs, private sectors, 50%women and 20% vulnerable groups)	452 trainings/workshops/coaching sessions on development needs prioritization, strategic planning, community mobilization, projects drafting, project implementation, funds raising, community info centers' management for 9345 participants (total), including 6,345 women (65%) and 3,286 men (35%), 742 representatives of ethnic minorities (8%), including 141 Roma (2%), 1408 older persons (15%), 709 young persons (6%), 523 persons with disabilities (6%).		* Trainers' report; * Agendas and lists of participants
	4. #of LPAs with	4. 0 LPAs with	4. The coverage of	60 LPAs with improved coverage and targeting the population,		* Project reports

Outputs	Performance Indicators	Indicator Baselines	Planned Indicator Targets	Achieved Indicator Targets	Reasons for Variance	Source of Verification
Outcome: To create (1) at policy level an enabling environment in Moldova for democratic local governance and community-led development through a facilitative policy, legal framework and institutionalized participatory, accountable, equitable local governance practices; and (2) at community level self-sustaining processes of social, economic and environmental development.						
	improved coverage and targeting the population, including women and vulnerable with the selected services delivery	improved coverage and targeting the population, including women and vulnerable with the selected services delivery	the most needed vulnerable groups of population with the selected local services increased by 20%	particularly women and vulnerable with the selected services delivery, including extended and improved educational services (in kindergartens and schools), water supply services, informational services, healthcare services for older and disabled persons.		* list of beneficiaries
	5. # of HR and gender sensitive local projects implemented	5. 0 HR and gender sensitive local projects implemented	5. 60 HR and gender sensitive local projects implemented	62 HR and gender sensitive local projects implemented	Two rural communities have implemented two projects	* Grants Guide; * Project reports
Output 4 **Rural communities and CSOs in Transnistrian region are empowered to participate in local development**	1# of communities mobilized for Community Action Plans approved	1. 0 target communities mobilized	1. 30 communities mobilized/action plans approved	* 30 communities action plans approved; * 30 community groups established, trained, coached and mentored.		* Community action plans approved;
	2. # of community meetings organized with participation of 50% women and 20% of vulnerable	2. 0 of community meetings organized with participation of 50% women and 20% of vulnerable	2 90 community meetings organized with participation of 50% women and 20% of vulnerable	* 93 community meetings held with participation of 70% women, 23% older persons, 30% ethnic minorities, 15% unemployed, 10% religious minorities		* Workshops and meeting reports; * Lists of participants
	3. # of stakeholders by types (local institutions, CSOs, private sector, general population (50% women and 20%vulnerable groups	3. 0 stakeholders in the target communities involved	3. 450 stakeholders by types: local institutions, SCOs, private sector, population including 50% women and 20% vulnerable involved	2,153 participants took part in trainings and community meetings including 45% LPAs and local institutions, 73% women, 20% older persons, 25% ethnic minorities, 10% unemployed, 10% religious minorities		* Lists of participants; * List of community group members
	4. # of training provided to LPAs and other stakeholders by types: CSOs, private sectors,	4. 0 of training provided to LPA and other stakeholders by types (CSOs, private sectors,	4. 120 training provided to LPA and other stakeholders by types: CSOs, private sector, population,	169 trainings held for LPAs and members of local community groups (45% LPAs and local institutions, 76% women, 17% older persons, 35% ethnic minorities, 10% religious minorities)		* Lists of participants * Agenda of the trainings * Trainers' report * Lists of participants

Outputs	Performance Indicators	Indicator Baselines	Planned Indicator Targets	Achieved Indicator Targets	Reasons for Variance	Source of Verification
Outcome: To create (1) at policy level an enabling environment in Moldova for democratic local governance and community-led development through a facilitative policy, legal framework and institutionalized participatory, accountable, equitable local governance practices; and (2) at community level self-sustaining processes of social, economic and environmental development.						
	50%women and 20% vulnerable groups)	women and vulnerable groups)	including 50% women, 20% vulnerable groups)			
	5. # of CSOs established and/or strengthening and functioning	5.0 of CSOs established and functioning	5. 15 CSOs established and/or strengthening and functioning	* 30 community groups established, trained, coached and mentored, of them 16 were CSOs-based; * 2 community groups got officially registered as NGOs.	The current legal framework of Transnistria is not encouraging for formal establishment of CSOs	* List of established community group members
	6. # of HR and gender sensitive local initiatives implemented	6.0 HR and gender sensitive local initiatives implemented	6. 30 HR and gender sensitive local initiatives implemented	30 HR and gender sensitive local initiatives implemented		* Grants Guide; * Project reports

ANNEX 2: MID-TERM REVIEW REPORT

UNITED NATIONS MOLDOVA

Mid-Term Review

Joint Integrated Local Development Programme

Report by:

Mathew Varghese, Team Leader
Andrea Lee Esser, Gender Specialist
Clare Romanik, Decentralisation Specialist
Monjurul Kabir, Human Rights Specialist

Acknowledgements

Authors express their gratitude for the guidance, useful contributions and methodological support provided in the development and coordination of this report to the State Chancellery, UNDP and UN Women Moldova, and Embassy of Sweden.

Our special thanks go to Congress of Local Authorities and representatives of local communities Cantemir town (Cantemir district), Tiganca commune (Cantemir district), Tibirica commune (Calarasi district) and Nisporeni town (Nisporeni district), Comrat town (Gagauz Yeri), Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Economy, Ministry of Education, Ministry of Social Protection and Family, Ministry of Regional Development and Construction, and to the Moldovan NGOs.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Joint Integrated Local Development Programme(JILDP) was designed to improve the policy framework, as well as to support administrative systems and procedures focused on efficient transfer of competencies to Local Public Administrations (LPAs) and the decentralization and promotion of LPAs' role in decision-making.The JILDP was launched in 2010 by the UNDP and UN Women in partnership with the Government of Moldova and is funded by the Government of Sweden. Because this project is concluding in 2012, the review is being conducted to inform the formulation of a new programme. Therefore, the focus of the review is on lessons learnt and the perspective is forward-looking.

The review had two objectives: 1) to do a brief mid-term review of the Joint Integrated Local Development Programme; and 2) to use the findings and recommendations of the review to develop a concept paper for the next phase of the programme[1].

The OECD criteria for relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, and sustainability were used throughout the assessment.

The mission was conducted in a highly participatory manner with involvement of all stakeholders, governments and national counterparts (State Chancellery, selected line ministries, local public authorities, Academy of Public Administration); civil society organizations, including women's organizations, human rights and minorities organizations, etc.; beneficiaries (women and men of the pilot communities, particularly the most vulnerable); program managers and decision makers (UNDP, UN Women, National Programme Coordinator,); UN agencies; Donors; and other stakeholders.

The Review took note of the fact that despite major issues on capacity, resource constraints and complexity in the implementation of the newly approved Decentralization Strategy, the government has stated the importance of the Strategy to make government service efficient and closer to the people taking into account their rights and needs.

The review concluded: Taking into account the contextual complexities and scope of the project objectives the review finds that the project design(even if relevant and successfully implemented to high standards) was too ambitious and complicated for

[1]Mid-term Review of the Joint Integrated Local Development Programme, with a specific focus on the gender equality and human rights based approach implementation, highlighting key findings (including best practices and lessons learnt), analysis of opportunities to provide guidance for the future programming, conclusions and recommendations. Develop a concept note for the expansion of interventions beyond 2012, which UN Moldova can offer as support to the Government in view of advancing with the implementation of the approved decentralization reform strategy. Particular attention shall be paid to human rights based and gender sensitive programming.

attempting to address all the challenges with such limited resources in a complex institutional and political environment.

The newly approved National Decentralization Strategy is owned and accepted by all the key stakeholders in central government, local government, and civil society. Feasible options for fiscal decentralization are on the table, with initial buy-in from the Ministry of Finance.One of the key pillars for successful implementation of the decentralization strategy depends heavily on fiscal decentralization and transfer of resources to LPA and consolidation of LPAs.

The community projects were the most visible and real success of the JILDP programme. The success was due to real collaboration between the Government, UNDP, UNWOMEN and most importantly the advocacy and technical support of Sida and Embassy of Sweden on HRBA and Gender.

The JILDP gender mainstreaming initiatives effectively targeted change in a number of issue areas identified by the CEDAW Committee in their concluding comments (2006), specifically:

- Introduction of gender mainstreaming strategy in public institutions, policies and programs supported by training.
- Advocacy campaigns to enhance women's awareness of their human rights.
- Measures to ensure that poverty alleviation programs are gender-sensitive and targeted at particular groups of women (e.g. Roma, disabled, elderly).
- Measures to increase the number of women in decision-making positions, in particular at the local level.

The JILDP team succeeded in mainstreaming gender and HRBA across a multi-faceted project due to working effectively across program components at multiple points of entry, thereby holistically tackling a complex issue at various levels (policy, local administrations and community level) in line with the project design.The project team made wise choices to invest time and resources up-front during the inception phase in gathering critical data that was used in communication and advocacy strategies as well as in informing development of methodologies and tools for rights-based and gender responsive decentralization reform, local planning and community mobilization.

The shift from an integrated local development project managed by a single UN agency (ILDP) to a jointly managed project that applied new approaches to mainstreaming gender and human rights (JILDP) entailed a certain measure of 'growing pains' during early stages.There has been, however, growing consensus amongst stakeholders that the mainstreaming approaches pioneered under the joint program made an important contribution to results. There is a need for continued consolidation of mainstreaming efforts.

The mainstreaming of HRBA and gender equality (GE) into the program ensured that decentralization reform processes resulted in meaningful improvements of people's lives,

particularly the most vulnerable women and men. JILDP success with gender and HR mainstreaming may be attributed in part to the effectiveness of individuals in key positions within the project team (international gender specialist, human rights advisor and national human rights specialist) to serve as drivers of change. In addition a culture of performance and strong management of UNDP and UN WOMEN ensured that despite the complexities the project activities were delivered and were of high quality. The JILDP can be credited for creating a confidence among national authorities a feeling that decentralisation is feasible despite the complexities.

The Review makes seven recommendations:

1. Continue support in the area of policy, regulatory coherence, and sector strategies selectively.

Implementing the decentralization strategy is the better way of service provision and there should be no going back now.The action plan to implement the decentralization strategy is relevant and should be implemented over a period of time. However, the project does not have the resources to support the government in all areas of the action plan. Neither does it have the resources to help the government implement the options that it puts forward for its consideration.To this end, the project should be very selective in its technical support for policy and strategy development. A number of key local service sectors should be selected and sectoral policy documents elaborated. Studies should be initiated only in correlation with the necessary institutional support and resources to implement the options/recommendations of the study.

2. Critically provide support for fiscal decentralization for ensuring that the new strategy of giving responsibility to LPAs is supported by predictable resources.

Fiscal decentralization is a critical area for priority implementation if the decentralization reform should have its intended effect and be sustainable. Providing power to municipalities without providing them the resources to carry out their new responsibilities only leads to apathy and frustration.The government must be encouraged through policy dialogue to speed up implementation of the fiscal decentralization despite obstacles of budget, law, etc. The government should also be given technical support in the implementation and monitoring of the fiscal decentralization. Six essential areas for fiscal decentralization are: i.) transparency, ii.) predictable and expanded funding directly to the 1st level of the LPAs, iii.) changing the policies to ensure that local governments' own revenue potential is fully utilized, iv.) changing the equalization system that dis-incentives local governments from generating more revenues, and v.) monitoring and evaluation of the fiscal decentralization, and vi) improve local government budgeting and financial management skills and practices to allow for accountable and efficient management of the new powers and resources. There is always doubt about the LPAs to budget and account to the finance ministry responsibly. However, if they are never allowed to manage their own finances independently,the LPAs will never learn.

3. Set up a governmental system to implement and monitor the decentralization strategy.

Central government needs a strong capacity to manage the reform and adapt it to the changing conditions. To this end, the Parity Commission, the Decentralization Policies Division in the State Chancellery and the Ministry of Finance need targeted, substantive, and sustained support. Without empowered political oversight and monitoring, the newly approved decentralization strategy might lose its initial enthusiasm and implementation momentum. An option would be to use existing institutional mechanisms and create a partnership between the Parliamentary Committee on Decentralization and the Congress of Local Public Authorities of Moldova (CALM) for monitoring implementation of the decentralization process.As the country's only unified local government association representing 500 LPAs, CALM has the ability to help the Parliamentary Committee collect information to assist in its oversight.

4. Support establishment of e-governance for LPAs

The Government of Moldova has been working to promote e-governance and ICT platforms to ensure open government and greater engagement of citizens in government policies and establish a robust service delivery mechanism. Successful pilot has been created with the support of UN WOMEN Women's Economic Empowerment Program on establishing a e-governance system at the level of LPA. Such ongoing work should be linked to implement the newly approved decentralization policy and service delivery at the local level. E-government and open government can support decentralization by ensuring:

- Greater access of vulnerable groups and marginalised communities (especially women) to service delivery mechanisms.
- Improved capabilities of the duty bearers (supply side) in implementing policies on the ground and ensuring service delivery.
- Development of capacities of the rights holders, i.e., the poor and the marginalized, including people in need of social protection such as those with disabilities (PWD).

5. Pilot inter-municipal cooperation projects and show the way forward for consolidation of LPAs.

Thanks to initial work conducted already under JILDP, inter-municipal cooperation is appreciated as a tool for improving efficiency and effectiveness of service delivery.The current legislation allows for pilots of several forms of inter-municipal cooperation for various priority sectors (e.g. education, social protection, energy efficiency, water, and solid waste). UNDP has considerable experience in the region in supporting

implementation of IMC (Macedonia, Montenegro, Ukraine). As there is so much work to be done, other development partners can be involved and this work should be coordinated.A good start is the joint conference organized by GIZ (Modernization of Local Public Service in the Republic of Moldova), USAID (Local Government Support Program) and UNDP/UN Women (JILDP).Community projects should also be introduced through inter-municipal cooperation project.The criteria and logic of clustering communities for inter-municipal projects should be well thought through before any action is taken.

6. Using lessons learnt from existing approaches and models, develop a model of vulnerability approach to community projects that can be easily scalable and replicablefor the next phase of the project.

The project should continue to deepen understanding of how social exclusion and vulnerability influences local planning and development processes in line with its current direction.It is incumbent on the project to recognize and learn from the differences in the three models of community empowerment piloted by JILDP.All of the models had merit and sound theoretical backing; all sought to integrate gender and human rights principles; and all followed understandable reasoning given the local context and constraints inherent in the project design.While the 'intensive' approach yielded better results in transforming communities and facilitating meaningful participation of vulnerable groups, the 'streamlined' and 'Transnistrian' approaches also developed local capacities to take into account gender and human rights in community processes.Models utilized different funding modalities, and required different investments in terms of time and human resources, offering valuable comparative data that should be fully analyzed at the close of the project cycle. The next phase of the project must bring together different funding and management modalities that draw on the collective JILDP pilot experiences to assemble a single methodological framework for inclusive community empowerment.

7. **Consolidate gender and HRBA models and concepts and incorporate it into all components of the next phase of the project.**

The project stands out in many ways because of the central attention given to operationalizing gender mainstreaming and HRBA.The tools and system generated by the project on gender and HRBA are innovative and instructional. The project should consolidate all efforts and models in gender mainstreaming and HRBA and design easy to implement models (for scalability and ease to replicate). The JLDP and its key partners the Government, UNDP, UN WOMEN have demonstrated that better results can be achieved by incorporating gender and HRBA at all levels and all activities of a decentralization strategy.

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION

The Joint Integrated Local Development Programme (JILDP) was designed to improve the policy framework, as well as to support administrative systems and procedures focused on efficient transfer of competencies to Local Public Administrations (LPAs) and the decentralization and promotion of LPAs' role in decision-making.The JILDP was launched in 2010 by the UNDP and UN Women in partnership with the Government of Moldova and is funded by the Government of Sweden. Because this project is concluding in 2012, the review is being conducted to inform the formulation of a new programme. Therefore, the focus of the review is on lessons learnt and the perspective is forward-looking.

This review looks at the changing context in Moldova, where recent economic growth has done little to alleviate the urban-rural divide, and 80% of the country's poor reside in rural areas.It also looks at the role and capacity of local governments in bringing service to the people, especially those who are vulnerable. In addition, the review takes note of the recommendations of 2011 UNDAF and ADR evaluation, which highlighted the need to support the decentralization agenda of the government to ensure that services reach the people.

In this context, the overall purpose of this brief review report is to highlight lessons from the experience of implementing the JILDP programme The review also seeks to clarify underlying factors affecting the situation, to highlight unintended consequences (positive and negative), and to help to better design the JILDP-supported interventions for the next stage.

1.1 ReviewObjectives

The mission had two objectives: 1) to do a brief mid-term review of the Joint Integrated Local Development Programme; and 2) to use the findings and recommendations of the review to develop a concept paper for the next phase of the programme[2].

As per the ToR, the purpose of the mid-term review is to examine the performance of the project since the beginning of its implementation. It is expected to:

- Assess the progress in project implementation, measured against planned outputs set forth in the Project Document, in accordance with rational budget allocations;
- Estimate the initial and potential impact of the intervention;

[2]Mid-term Review of the Joint Integrated Local Development Programme, with a specific focus on the gender equality and human rights based approach implementation, highlighting key findings (including best practices and lessons learnt), analysis of opportunities to provide guidance for the future programming, conclusions and recommendations. Develop a concept note for the expansion of interventions beyond 2012, which UN Moldova can offer as support to the Government in view of advancing with the implementation of the approved decentralization reform strategy. Particular attention shall be paid to human rights based and gender sensitive programming.

- Assess early signs of the project success or weakness and prompt necessary adjustments;
- Address the underlying causes and issues contributing to targets not adequately achieved;
- Derive recommendations for any necessary changes in the overall design and orientation of the project by evaluating the adequacy, efficiency, and effectiveness of its implementation;
- Identify lessons learnt and best practices from the project that could be applied to future and other on-going projects, including the added value of the collaboration under the joint programme.

1.2 Review Scope

The evaluation aims to assess the outcome, outputs, activities and inputs of the project since 2009. The results of the evaluation will be used for re-focusing the interventions and guiding future programming. In this context, the review will:

- Extract lessons for future interventions for the decentralization strategy;
- Outline main areas for next stage of the JILDP project with specific reference to Gender and Human Rights;
- Focus on lessons learnt that can be used for the next phase of the project.

1.3 The Evaluation Criteria

The following OECD criteria were recommended in the Terms of Reference for assessing progress through this review:

- Relevance: the degree to which the purpose of the JILDP project remains valid and pertinent.

- Efficiency: the productivity of the implementation process, how good and how cost-efficient was the process of transforming inputs into outputs and outcomes.

- Effectiveness: a measure of the extent to which projects have contributed through an effective use of their results.

- Capacity development: as a key to development effectiveness, the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals and sustainable local development.

The specific approach and activities of the Joint Integrated Local Development Programme, including the extent to which they furthered the realization of human rights and gender equality, are to be analyzed with recommendations for better alignment to

support policy and capacity development in the area of decentralization and local development, both for the remaining project period and for the future intervention.

From HRBA and Gender Equality perspectives, the mid-term review should focus on: 1) how well the programme targeted the identified rights and needs of male and female beneficiaries; 2) the rights the programme advanced under CEDAW, CERC, CERD, UPR, ICESCR, the Millennium Development Goals and other international development commitments; 3) how women and men of the pilot communities (right holders) have been enabled to exercise their rights and central and how local public authorities (duty bearers) are complying with their responsibilities; 4) the changes in access to and use of resources, decision-making power, and work burden for women and for men.

1.4 Methodology and Limitations

The review methodology was designed using guidelines from the *UNDP Handbook on Monitoring and Evaluating for Results* along with the *UNDP Guidelines for Outcome Evaluators*. The data was collected through the following activities:

- Desk review of relevant documents (overall programme and project documents with amendments made, narrative reports–inception /final, donor-specific, as well as UN Treaty Bodies' recommendations to Moldova including CEDAW, CERC, CERD, UPR, ICESCR etc.);
- Discussions with the Senior Management and programme staff of UNDP and UN Women, as well as the programme team;
- Interviews with partners and stakeholders (including gathering information on what the partners have achieved with regard to the outcome and what strategies they have used);
- Field visits to selected project sites and discussions with project teams, project beneficiaries;
- Consultation meetings with NGOs/think-tanks;
- Stakeholder meetings and debriefing sessions with relevant UN Agencies (UNDP and UN Women), development partners (Embassy of Sweden) and the Government (State Chancellery).

The mission was conducted in a highly participatory manner with involvement of all stakeholders, governments and national counterparts (State Chancellery, selected line ministries, local public authorities, Academy of Public Administration); civil society organizations, including women's organizations, human rights and minorities organizations, etc.; beneficiaries (women and men of the pilot communities, particularly the most vulnerable); program managers and decision makers (UNDP, UN Women, National Programme Coordinator,); UN agencies; Donors; and other stakeholders.

The review focused on project concept and objectives. It was agreed during the initial stage of the discussion that the focus of the review will be on strategic lessons learnt for the next phase of the project. Due to limitations of time, the evaluation did not focus on

all project activities but rather selected a sample of activities to draw its findings, conclusions, and recommendations.

1.5 Composition of the Review Team

The review team was composed of an independent international team of a Senior Team Leader and a Gender Specialist. Additionally, the team was supported by the Policy Advisor for Human Rights, Justice & Legal Empowerment and the Decentralization Advisor from the UNDP Bratislava Regional Center.

The UNDP CO, UN Women and the Project provided support to the mission by i) liaising with national stakeholders in the country; ii) assisting the team with the identification and collection of necessary information, data, and documentation related to the programme, as well as with the conduct of roundtable discussions and consultations; and iii) managing logistical and administrative support that was required by the team.

CHAPTER 2: PROGRAMME CONTEXT AND CHALLENGES

The complexity of the decentralization process in Moldova should be understood from an historic perspective. The reform of the decentralization has gone through several stages and was affected by changes in the political power systems in charge of state administration. The reform of 1998 assigned greater authority to local governments in administrative and fiscal matters and encouraged consolidation of fragmented administrative territorial units, establishing 10 regional entities, Chisinau having a special status. In 2001, the new state administration decided to return the public administration system to a pre-1998 administrative organization based on rayons or districts. The 2003 reform substantially restricted their fiscal autonomy by eliminating some of the existing taxation powers and diminished the self-financing capacity. These reforms brought about numerous and significant alterations of local government legislation, creating a sense of legal instability and unpredictability.

Since 2009, the government explicitly acknowledged that decentralization represents an essential item on the reform agenda of the country. The goal was to improve resources management and to bring quality services closer to citizens; to strengthen the system of local fiscal autonomy (in line with European Union standards); to give more decision-making powers to the local governments, following the principles of transparency, legality, efficiency, responsibility and administrative solidarity; and to create a more stable, clear, and enforceable legal framework on local public finance.

On April 5, 2012, the Parliament approved the new Decentralization Strategy after an extensive consultation process. The Decentralization Strategy is the main policy document in the field of local public administration, determining the national mechanisms on decentralization. The Strategy has incorporated international standards for gender and human rights throughout the document. Its goal is to ensure that local public authorities function in a democratic and autonomous manner, have adequate capacity and resources to provide public services according to the needs and preferences of beneficiaries, and operate effectively and efficiently and with strict financial discipline. There four main areas of the Decentralization Strategy are: (1) decentralization of competencies and services; (2) financial decentralization; (3) property decentralization and local development; and (4) organization and functioning of local public authorities, territorial-administrative organization, democracy, participation, ethics, and institutional capacity.

A Comprehensive Action Plan for implementation of the Strategy has been prepared and it includes: (1) allocation of responsibilities; (2) fiscal decentralization; (3) decentralization of property; (4) local economic development, urban and regional planning; (5) territorial-administrative organization; (6) institutional capacity; (7) democracy, participation and ethics. The action plan is at various stages of discussion and study. The implementation of the new Decentralization Strategy is going in parallel to the many ongoing public administration reforms that have been undertaken by the government since 2009. To this end, there is continuing confusion on the competencies of the various levels of the government.

Currently, Moldova has two levels of local public administration (LPA).The 1st level comprises 898 communes and towns. It has directly elected executive and representative branches. The 2nd level comprises 32 rayons (districts), Chisinau and semi-autonomous territorial units. In many functional areas, clarity is lacking on the respective role, authority and responsibilities of the different levels of LPAs.Although in the 1st level the local governments in Moldova do have major responsibility for service delivery in communal services (water, sanitation, heat, roads) and education—as well as limited responsibility in health and social assistance—in terms of local fiscal autonomy the country is far behind other European countries, including those of southeast Europe. This leads to a situation were the local governments have extensive responsibilities assigned by law but without the powers or means to implement the responsibility. In Moldova, 1st level local governments are fully responsible for pre-school education, made possible through national government budget transfers.The 1st tier of Moldovan local governments have much smaller populations than many other countries in southeast Europe, although it is in comparison to several of the new EU 12 countries.[3]

The current intergovernmental fiscal system provides neither incentives for local revenue generation nor for cost savings, as central government transfers are intended to fill the gap between revenues and expenditures.Transfers to 1st level of LPAs are unpredictable in two ways.First, the pool of funds for the government transfers are determined each year by the budget law and are not tied to GDP, total government revenues, or specific tax revenue.Second, the transfers cascade to the 1st level LPA through the 2nd level LPA in a non-transparent manner. In sum, the system does not encourage initiative for revenue generation or planning for strategic investments. Analysis of local governments' own revenues and intergovernmental fiscal system in Moldova finds that[4]:

- Around 70% of local government revenues come of government transfers for education;
- Local governments' own revenue potential is not utilized;
- Local taxes and own revenues are largely influenced by national policies, especially tax on real estate;
- Current equalization system discourages local governments to generate more revenues;
- Capital investment is based on Local government budget surplus and ad-hoc grants from the state; there is no multi-year capital investment planning and budgeting; and there is no local borrowing.

Income and human development inequality have grown over the last two decades between the capital city and the rest of the country, between urban and rural areas and, more recently, between the six development regions. The greatest socio-economic

[3]Czech Republic, Slovakia, Hungary, Romania, and Estonia have 1st tier local governments with small population size.

[4]UNDP, Report on Policy Proposals for Improvement of Local Government Finance System in Moldova, Corporate & Public Management Consulting Group, 2012.

difference is between the Chisinau Municipality and the other territorial administrative units. The capital is not only the center of consumption and income but also of public expenses and welfare. In fact, as recent research suggests, Moldova displays one of the highest degree of polarization of economic life in Europe. Economic growth has been unbalanced not only geographically but also from a gender perspective. Per capita gross domestic product for men is now about sixty percent higher than per capita gross domestic product for women[5].

Despite major issues on capacity, resource constraints and complexity in the implementation of the Decentralization Strategy, the government has stated the importance of the Strategy to make government service efficient and closer to the people.

[5] The Republic of Moldova, The Second Millennium Development Goals Report, September 2010.

CHAPTER 3: PROGRAMME OBJECTIVES

The Integrated Local Development Programme started in 2007 and was adjusted in 2009 to become the Joint Integrated Local Development Programme, with the introduction of a strong focus on the human rights based approach and gender equality.The total budget for the 2nd phase of the JILDP programme was 7.92 million US dollars and Government of Sweden contributes 6.5 million towards the programme. The contribution from UNDP is 0.59 million. The LPAs were to contribute a sum of 0.47 million, and 0.21million remained unfunded.

UNDP and UN Women implemented the second phase of project jointly.The project was redesigned to improve the policy framework, as well as to support the administrative systems and procedures focused on efficient transfer of competencies to Local Public Administrations (LPAs), decentralization and promotion of LPAs' role in decision-making. The focus of the project shifted to building capacity of LPAs to plan, implement and monitor their strategic plans and improve local public service delivery, involving civil society and community efforts. Promoting the values of gender equality, human rights, inclusive development and participation of the people were mainstreamed into the project implementation strategy.

The development objectives of the project were to assist the Republic of Moldova to ensure that vulnerable groups in poor rural and urban areas take advantage of sustainable socio-economic development opportunities through adequate regional and local policies implemented by LPA and partners in a rights based, gender sensitive manner.

The interlinked immediate objectives and planned activities of the project were:

Objective 1: To assist the Government of the Republic of Moldova to upgrade national legal, policy and advisory frameworks to support sustainable processes of development at sub-national level.

Activities:

- Develop capacity of the Government (State Chancellery) and relevant Parliamentary Commissions for policy formulation, coordination, implementation, monitoring and evaluation.
- Provide policy advice, analysis, and research in the area of local democratic governance, decentralization and local development.
- Support Government (State Chancellery) to ensure coordination and coherence in approaches to local/regional development by all partners.
- Awareness and communication about the reform process and the programme.

Objective 2: To develop capacity of local authorities for rights based and gender responsive planning, budgeting, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of development initiatives

Activities:

- Develop and implement Social and Economic Development Strategies of 10 Towns in a gender-sensitive and participatory manner.

- Develop capacity of 10 Target Rayons and 10 Towns for participatory and gender-sensitive planning, performance budgeting and financial management, monitoring and evaluation.
- Support for improvement of local public service and utilities management (Local Services and Utilities) and access of most vulnerable to services and utilities with focus on inter-municipal cooperation
- Provide support for the Association of Mayors.

Objective 3: To empower rural communities and CSOs in target regions to actively participate in local development planning, implementation and monitoring and have better access to improved service delivery and community infrastructure

Activities:

- Mobilize target communities for community-led gender-sensitive development
- Provide gender-sensitive training, capacity development and transfer of knowledge on local development for community actors
- Support the development of an information, monitoring and evaluation system to be managed locally and based on indicators
- Support to gender-sensitive Local Development Programs/Projects.

While the JILDP applies a holistic approach to programming, tackling the challenges at all levels of the governance, it seeks to mainstream human rights and gender equality issues into all its activities. Thus, at the policy level, the programme focuses on ensuring transparent, non-discriminative, inclusive and evidence-based policy making, based on the principles of human rights and gender equality. At the local level the programme's key focus is on the development of capacities of local authorities on rights-based and gender-responsive policy and budget planning and implementation. At the community level, the programme works to enhance capacities of the local community members in articulating and voicing their needs to equally participate and benefit from the development initiatives.

JILDP was selected as one of three pilot programs globally to operationalize a gender sensitive, rights-based approach under a cooperative agreement between UNDP and SIDA[6]. When defining HRBA in the Moldovan context, UNDP and SIDA agreed to focus on four core principles of: participation, non-discrimination, transparency and accountability.In the implementation of the four principles of HRBA, emphasis was put on the advancement of vulnerable women, men, and groups.

[6]In 2009 UNDP and SIDA Head Quarters agreed to work together on implementing a rights-based approach in three pilot countries, Moldova was the first to start implementation of the agreement with the JILDP project.

CHAPTER 4: KEY FINDINGS

4.1 The Programme Concept

The review used the European Charter of Local Self-Government and its definition of local government to draw frameworks to measure progress of the project.

> "Local self-government denotes the right and the ability of local authorities, within the limits of the law, to regulate and manage a substantial share of public affairs under their own responsibility and in the interests of the local population[7]."

As in other countries, the implementation of the reform agenda on decentralization and local governance is complex and tenacious in Moldova. The reasons for the complexities include: i) politics; ii) ongoing public administration reform where policy and regulatory changes have been slow to be implemented; iii) past history of changes and re-changes of decentralization policy has created a sense of legal instability and unpredictability; iv) multiple layers to be reformed; v) lack of capacity and resources to take forward the reform agenda without external funds and technical support; vi) building consensus around the policy, regulatory, sector strategy and financial aspects have been difficult; vii) and importantly, the capacity of local public authorities to plan and implement servicesis very limited.Therefore, the reform agenda that the project tried to address was complex in its various dimensions. To this end, the review found it necessary to establish a basic framework against which to assess the progress of the project and its national system-wide effects.

In developing the framework the review looked at the challenges to achieve the aspiration of definition of local government in the European Charter. The key question was the challenges faced to getting better service closer to the people and whether people can take decisions that affect their lives.Having defined the challenges that the project was intended to resolve, the review then set out to compare what was planned and implemented, and the results this produced, with a simple "Theory of Change" that set out how the three interlinked objectives and their activities were intended to work to overcome the challenges.

The Theory of Change shows the pathway along which the reform were intended to move in order to achieve the ultimate objective of LPAs being better able to provide efficient services closer to the citizens. The Theory shows those changes that would need to be taken at various levels to address its key challenges and move towards the objective.

The underlying methodological approach of the review was therefore to evaluate how far along the pathway the various aspect of the decentralization reform travelled by assessing the achievements of the activities of the three objectives in terms of outcomes and progress towards getting better service closer to the people and enabling people to take decisions that affect their lives.

European Charter of Local Self-Government, Council of Europe, 1985

In order to overcome the challenges, the JILDP project adopted three objectives: (a) assist the Government of the Republic of Moldova to upgrade national policy, legal and strategic frameworks; (b) develop the capacity of local authorities for rights based and gender-responsive planning, budgeting, implementation; and (c) empower selected rural communities and civil societies to actively participate in local development planning and implementation.

Challenge 1. There were many challenges at the start of the project for effective decentralization reform. The first challenge was that there was neither a policy or decentralization strategynor a coherent regulatory environment at the national level. At the LPA level there was no accepted democratic principles, accountability or transparency. There was limited fiscal autonomy, limited fiscal potential and a lack of incentive for fiscal responsibility. The financial transfer system was inefficient, unpredictable, and opaque. This meant that there was no direction, system, or coherence in the decentralization reform agenda.

Project Output 1

- The project supported the development of the new national decentralization strategy. The strategy was developed through a highly consultative process.Gender and human rights have been mainstreamed into the strategy with detailed elaboration included in the annexes.

- The project also helped develop an ambitious action plan to implement the strategy.

- Fiscal decentralization options have been identified and are being consulted.

The above three outputs have given a direction, system, and coherence to the decentralization agenda. However, the policy will only be operationalized through the implementation of the action plan and fiscal options.

Challenge 2. The second challenge was that in an absent policy environment there was no system to ensure the horizontal and vertical coherence of sectoral ministry strategies such as in the area of health, education, social protection, property etc. This meant that the different ministries had different conceptual and operational modalities to deal with service provision and working with LPAs. In addition, there was confusion of competence.

Project Output 2

- A registry of competency has been compiled by the project.

- Options are being identified for much-needed property issues.

- Work has begun on options for education and work is also expected to start soon for social protection

The registry and identification of options for consideration are all high quality work, well consulted and context specific. The options will become the essential foundation for implementation. Although the study of options is a good beginning, only implementation of the options will make them real. The Government of Moldova will require extensive support far beyond the scope of the project to implement the options.

Challenge 3. The third challenge was widely referred to as *fragmentation* of the LPAs with about 32 Rayons and about 898 LPAs. Most of the LPAs cover very small populations and it was difficult to see the LPAs as a viable means of effective or efficient service delivery to the people.

Project Output 3

- The issue related to fragmentation has been analysed, options were proposed, and the problems are clearly identified.

- In a small pilot way,inter-municipal cooperation has been initiated and champions of IMC were trained.

Consolidation of LPAs requires political will and policy action and will have to wait until the next election of LPAs.Reforms targeted at consolidation are complex and beyond the means of the project. However, the project can show examples of benefits from consolidation through inter-municipal projects. Introducing the concept of inter-municipal cooperation was not originally part of the Programme concept, but this was an important contribution to setting out the next stage for implementation of the decentralization strategy.

Challenge 4. The fourth challenge was capacity of the LPAs. There was confusion of competence, low institutional capacity, and a lack of knowledge in community planning, including lack of awareness of the concept of gender equality and rights based approach in community planning.

Project Output 4

- An institutional framework for decentralization has been developed. The project has raised awareness of decentralization by explaining it to the cabinet of ministers, parliamentary commission, and the parity commission led by the Prime Minister.

- Visits, study tours, and training programmes have been conducted to increase awareness and capacity of Central Public Authorities and LPAs.

- An assessment of LPA capacity was carried out and the assessment was supported with the elaboration of the institutional capacity plans.

- An association of local authorities (CALM) and a women mayors network have been encouraged and supported by the project.

The steps taken are important and have greatly contributed to both awareness and capacity. The use of NGOs in the capacity building has greatly developed relations between LPAs and NGOs and has been cost effective. The programme concept and implementation took into consideration the Academy for Public Administration (APA) as a natural partner for trainings, as well as repository for knowledge and training materials produced under JILDP.Capacity building is an area where more can be done during the next phase of the project.

Challenge 5. The fifth challenge was natural outcome of the other four. The LPAs lacked the basic minimum resource to provide service and capacity to carry out its responsibility. LPAs own revenue potential was not utilized and it was constrained and discouraged. Eighty five percent of the LPAs cannot pay for their own administrative costs. Communities also lacked viable CSO/CBO to support and hold accountable local governance.

Project Output 5

- 10 intensive projects with vulnerability approach were piloted and 60 streamlined projects were implemented (plus another 30 projects in Transnistria and security zone). Almost all were highly successful.

- Vulnerability-based community development models and tools successfully implemented in all communities.

The projects were the most visible and tangible success of the JILDP programme at the local level. The collaboration between the Government, the Government of Sweden, UNDP and UNWOMEN was key to the success of the project, as each brought their unique capacity and technical expertise to the project. JLDP designed and successfully implemented two models of community empowerment.

Challenges	Project Outputs	Objective
Lack of policy, regulatory environment, democratic principles and transparency and limited fiscal autonomy	Policy owned by all layers. Action plan for implementation of the policy developed. Fiscal options identified	**Better service closer to the people and people can take decisions that affect their lives.**
Lack of system to ensure horizontal and vertical coherence of sectoral ministry strategies.	Registry of competency compiled, options identified for property issues, work started on options for education and social protection	
Fragmentation of the LPAs and with very small population to be viable.	Issue analyzed and options proposed. Inter-municipal cooperation initiated	
Capacity. Confusion in competence, low institutional capacity and lack of knowledge in community	Institutional framework supported, LPA capacity assessment conducted and support for LPA institutional capacity; CALM capacity enhanced	

planning		
LPA. Lack of resource to local level to provide service and carry out its responsibility; lack of viable CSO/CBO	10 intensive projects with vulnerability approach and 60 streamlined projects and 30 in Transnistria and security zone. Vulnerability based community development models implemented	

4.2 Human Rights Based Approach and Gender Mainstreaming

JILDPsoughtto apply HRBA and gender mainstreaming methodically in all aspects of the decentralization agenda.Activity highlights include:

- Research and dissemination of a study identifying vulnerable groups and barriers to participation; assessment of vulnerable group representation and participation in local elections; sociological study on women and men from vulnerable groups to improve understanding of root causes of vulnerability in pilot areas.
- Wide consultations and inclusive participatory processes of vulnerable groups to input into Decentralization Strategy resulting in incorporation of HRBA/GE elements.
- Capacity assessments and targeted HRBA/GE training organized for key institutions from central to local level as well as project staff.
- Development of innovative gender-sensitive HRBA methodology and tools for community empowerment.
- On-going advocacy to raise awareness of vulnerable groups in the context of decentralization using diverse communication media (e.g. posters, television, radio, photo exhibits).
- Strategic support to female mayors and councillors to build capacities via CALM-WN.
- Adaptive approach in Transnistria focusing on GE as entry point to a broader HRBA; training and technical support for Transnistrian CBOs and NGOs on gender mainstreaming and women's empowerment in local development.

The project team took a staged approach to build their evidence base before designing or operationalizing strategies. Research conducted locally on vulnerabilities helped to deepen understanding of the particular issues for Moldova in targeting gender equality and universal human rights. The team effectively moved from abstract theoretical concepts of GE and HRBA into concrete operationalization and targeting of vulnerable groups for social inclusion and empowerment in pilot communities.Efforts were made to educate and advocate for GE and HR at all levels of engagement through:

- Research and evidence – generated studies, reports, disaggregated data of the human rights and gender equality issues in the context of Moldovan decentralization and local development.

- Tools and methodologies – designed and piloted for rights-based and gender-responsive decentralization reform, local planning and community mobilization.

- Advocacy, awareness-raising and capacity development – conducted in partnership with key government and non-governmental partner institutions.

The project piloted two models of community empowerment in a total of 70 communities, with an additional 30 communities in Transnistria. Sixty communities were organized under a 'streamlined' approach that enhanced LPA understanding of GE and HRBA and encouraged community participation in identifying and prioritizing problems.All funds for selected activities under this model were disbursed through the LPA. Ten communities were organized under an 'intensive' approach that took carefully monitored measures to enable identification and active participation of vulnerable groups in all stages of the local development process.Funds for selected activities under this model were disbursed through local civil society organizations.Work conducted in 30 Transnistrian communities offered political space for JILDP to support nascent community based organizations and to introduce new concepts of gender equality and human rights into local development processes.

As illustrated in the Theory of Change, the activities planned for the project had the aim to address all the challenges at all levels (while ensuring that HRBA and gender was mainstreamed) i.e. policy development, institutional arrangements, regulatory aspects, sectoral ministerial strategy and coherence, capacity and service delivery of LPAs, also including intensive projects that use a vulnerability approach. All the activities were to be implemented with limited time and resources and, therefore, the design of the project can be concluded as ambitious and complex.

The JILDP sought to integrate a comprehensive gender and HRBA into a complex program structure that encompassed three inter-related realms of policy, local governance and community empowerment, plus an additional focus on the Transnistria region.The team faced considerable challenges to find practical means of operationalizing theoretical concepts in a way that led to measurable changes in people's lives.In spite of the complexities and challenges, the team made notable progress, managing against the odds to mainstream gender and human rights into diverse project activities, thereby making a valuable contribution to transformative change processes.

JILDP success in effectively mainstreaming gender and HRBA is especially noteworthy due to the complexity of the project, geographic breadth, and the lack of pre-existing methodologies. Mainstreaming success is evident in the decentralization policy, improved LPA awareness and capacities to target the most vulnerable, and expanded public participation (including vulnerable groups) in the local development processes of targeted communities. In addition, the work done in Transnistria to introduce new concepts of gender equality and human rights made a significant contribution to the nascent civil society organization's to raise awareness and develop capacities.The work may be credited with sparking catalytic changes in both thinking and practice. Positive indicators of change include enthusiastic learning, self-directed activities by some CSO groups to expand knowledge networks, and increased ability to secure external resources.

4.3 Reasons for Success of JILDP GM and HRBA for local governance

Drivers of change. Project success with integrating gender and HRBA may be attributed in part to the effectiveness of individuals in key positions within the project team to serve as drivers of change.In particular, the international gender specialist, human rights advisor and national human rights specialist all played pivotal roles in advocating for adjustments to standard thinking to allow for greater inclusivity across project components. Additionally, the entire project team demonstrated a growing ability to apply mainstreaming approaches and facilitate broader integration of gender and HRBA ideals in various aspects of project work.

Sound strategies.JILDP success with mainstreaming gender and human rights in decentralization processes is also the result of a sound strategic approach to build a local evidence base to inform operationalization strategies and advocacy efforts.The JILDP team worked effectively to build on the existing knowledge base, and to foster collaboration and cooperation between groups with specialized knowledge and interests.This methodology was well targeted to the Moldovan context, which presents a veneer of gender and social equality that is difficult to penetrate.

JILDP played a significant role to raise awareness of vulnerable groups in local governance, and to further dialogue within government and partner agencies to address specific needs of marginalized groups.The vulnerabilities approach allowed for the gender issue to emerge within the broader issue of human rights, revealing how layers of discrimination and exclusion can function to disenfranchise certain groups.Evidence of project success is in the integration of gender and human rights elements in the decentralization strategy, which includes three comprehensive annexes on gender, human rights, and vulnerabilities as they relate to the strategy.

Innovative approach. The vulnerability approach, as operationalized in the JILDP, makes a valuable contribution to development theory.Drawing from multiple theoretical and practical resources, the process puts forth new thinking on applying human rights principles to local level development processes, offering tools and frameworks to guide practitioners.The approach effectively guides communities to understand how layers of vulnerability across socio-economic categories can deepen the degree to which groups are marginalized from meaningful participation and personal/group/community empowerment.It lays out a community development model that seeks to identify and overcome these obstacles to the full realization of human rights.

Pilot models.The JILDP displayed strength and adaptability as a team in piloting different models of community empowerment: the ‘streamlined,’ ‘intensive,’ and ‘Transnistrian’ models.Development of different models was influenced by numerous factors including: variable contexts; project structure; institutional frameworks; individual experiences and theoretical stances.While not without adversarial moments within the team, pilot initiatives proved a valuable means of trialing different modes of mainstreaming gender and human rights into local level processes.

4.4Key Findings on Project Process and Outputs

The newly approved National Decentralization Strategy is owned and accepted by all the key stakeholders in central government, local government and civil society. This can be attributed to the participatory and consultative process supported by the project. The nationwide consultation process for the Strategy involved over 2400 participants.

Following the local elections in 2011, the government has launched a national training programme for newly local elected officials.Currently it is recorded that more than 9,000 officials have been trained with the assistance of JILDP. The Mayors reported that the training programmes for the newly elected officials helped them to acquire knowledge in local public administration fundamentals, the decentralization process, as well as the application of human rights and gender equality principles in local affairs.

The project produced an impressive number of policy study and policy option papers, including Territorial-Administrative Structure, Vulnerability Study, Fiscal Options Papers, Registry of Competence, Property Option Paper, etc. These studies and options are context-specific, done through a consultative process, and were analysed by the review team and found to be of high quality.

For the regular citizen, decentralization is still associated with administrative territorial reform and not enough with the end outcome of increased power of citizens over decisions that affect the quality of their life. According to members of Parliamentary Committee on Decentralization, CALM and the NGO Contact, there is still a great need for awareness-raising among all citizens (and especially marginalized groups) over what to expect from decentralization.In most cases, except where the communities have implemented JILDP-supported projects, the people have seen little benefit from the decentralization process.

Feasible options for fiscal decentralization are on the table, with initial buy-in from the Ministry of Finance.JILDP's technical support to the Ministry of Finance has culminated into proposals based on international best practices that the Ministry recognizes are needed to implement. For example, one proposal is for revenue sharing based on the taxes and fees, as is widely practiced in the region, perhaps giving local governments the right to impose local surcharges on taxes and fees.One proposal under serious consideration by the Ministry of Finance is for the Ministry to determine (and publish) transfer amounts to 1st tier LGs and take the rayon out of the equation, as the current arrangements are too subject to political negotiations.The implementation of the fiscal options is important for the decentralization strategy to succeed.

CALM is recognized as a voice for local governments in Moldova and it has the potential to strengthen the capacity of local governments, through both political leadership and technical specialists. JILDP was instrumental in these achievements. When CALM was established, for its first two years it had 200 municipalities as members. It now has 500 members (out of 898).About 10% are paying membership fees. In two years it has created several partnerships with local government associations from Romania, Bulgaria, Latvia, Norway, and Estonia.It is also a member of the Network of Associations of Local Authorities of Southeast Europe.CALM is one of few institutions in Moldova that include

representatives from different political parties.At the beginning, the JILDP institutional support (1,5 years after CALM's creation) allowed them to create a newsletter, website, maintain connection with the LPAs in the territories, organize roundtables and seminars, and create a secretariat that could be fully engaged on designing and organizing these activities.

The Network of Women Mayors created under the auspices of CALM has shown the potential to raise women's issues and promote women in leadership. The network has accomplished a lot with very small monetary inputs from JILDP, showing strong leadership and motivation. Research on the priorities of female mayors and councilors is recommended before the close of the project to better understand the impact of women's leadership (or lack thereof) on local governance. While there is often an implicit assumption that women leaders will pursue a more people-centered, pro-women agenda, data specific to the Moldovan cultural context is lacking, and it is not clear how transferable data may be from other countries. This research should be conducted in full consultation with CALM, the CALM-WN and other key stakeholders as a means of instilling broad participation and ownership of the findings. Findings may inform initiatives in the next phase of the project.

The streamlined community empowerment approach demonstrated a measure of success in working with communities to build awareness of gender and human rights issues in local development processes.Broad participation was encouraged, and JILDP-funded local projects were selected with respect to these ideals. While there was community participation in meetings and planning inputs, responsibility for and ownership of projects rested heavily with the LPA and the external community mobilizer.Sustainability of process-based changes to community development is questionable in the absence of the community mobilizer, however this challenge has been mitigated and community local community mobilizers have actively been engaged.Model strengths included more efficient (faster) local level processes as well as less intensive requirements for human resource inputs for community mobilization.Funding of projects through the LPA was well targeted, given the project focus on building capacities of local authorities.However, lack of funding to other community-based groups did not facilitate emergence of a strong civil society.

The intensive model of community empowerment was also successful in building local awareness of vulnerable groups in local development.Under this model, vulnerable groups not only participated in meetings and planning inputs, but became credible and empowered partners in the processes and searched for solutions to address identified problems.This approach demonstrated strong potential for community transformation and inclusive empowerment.It also showed positive signs of facilitating sustained meaningful engagement between the people and the LPA to work together to solve community problems within a gender and human rights based framework.This model required protracted timelines for organization and facilitation as well as more intensive human resource inputs for community mobilization.Funding of community projects exclusively through CSOs ran a risk of antagonizing relations between the people and the authorities,

although this risk was recognized and mitigated by staff efforts to fully engage both groups in a synergistic fashion.

Project experiences at the local level demonstrate that CSO is not a substitute for effective local government. Neither is local government able to function effectively in the absence of an empowered community that engages all groups. LPAs and CSOs are interlinked entities that must work in concert to contribute to a community development model that meets the needs of all members of society including the most marginalized. The next phase of the project must bring together fully these two entities through expanded funding and management modalities that draw on the collective JILDP experiences to glean a single methodological framework for inclusive community empowerment.

A tendency persists for both internal and external agents to see JILDP as a UN Women project *or* a UNDP project depending on their particular stance. Continued efforts must be made to recognize and break down these divisions for the duration of the project and for the next phase. Ownership over all strategies and results, including the commendable work that has been done by the project to operationalize gender and HRBA, must be collective. There is a need to ensure that forward momentum on mainstreaming is continued until the end of the project cycle, and that groups work in a coordinated fashion to elevate the profile of gender and human rights issues in local governance in line with UN mandates.

Chapter 5: Conclusions and Recommendations

5.1 Conclusions

Taking into account the contextual complexities and scope of the project objectives the review finds that the project design(even if relevant and successfully implemented to high standards) was too ambitious and complicated for attempting to address all the challenges with such limited resources in a complex institutional and political environment.

The newly approved National Decentralization Strategy is owned and accepted by all the key stakeholders in central government, local government, and civil society. Feasible options for fiscal decentralization are on the table, with initial buy-in from the Ministry of Finance.One of the key pillars for successful implementation of the decentralization strategy depends heavily on fiscal decentralization and transfer of resources to LPA and consolidation of LPAs.

The community projects were the most visible and real success of the JILDP programme. The success was due to real collaboration between the Government, UNDP, UNWOMEN and most importantly the advocacy and technical support of SIDA on HRBA and Gender.

The JILDP gender mainstreaming initiatives effectively targeted change in a number of issue areas identified by the CEDAW Committee in their concluding comments (2006), specifically:

- Introduction of gender mainstreaming strategy in public institutions, policies and programs supported by training.
- Advocacy campaigns to enhance women's awareness of their human rights.
- Measures to ensure that poverty alleviation programs are gender-sensitive and targeted at particular groups of women (e.g. Roma, disabled, elderly).
- Measures to increase the number of women in decision-making positions, in particular at the local level.

The JILDP team succeeded in mainstreaming gender and HRBA across a multi-faceted project due to working effectively across program components at multiple points of entry, thereby holistically tackling a complex issue at various levels (policy, local administrations and community level) in line with the project design.The project team made wise choices to invest time and resources up-front during the inception phase in gathering critical data that was used in communication and advocacy strategies as well as in informing development of methodologies and tools for rights-based and gender responsive decentralization reform, local planning and community mobilization.

The shift from an integrated local development project managed by a single UN agency (ILDP) to a jointly managed project that applied new approaches to mainstreaming gender and human rights (JILDP) entailed a certain measure of 'growing pains' during early stages.There has been, however, growing consensus amongst stakeholders that the mainstreaming approaches pioneered under the joint program made an important contribution to results. There is a need for continued consolidation of mainstreaming efforts.

The mainstreaming of HRBA and gender equality (GE) into the program ensured that decentralization reform processes resulted in meaningful improvements of people's lives, particularly the most vulnerable women and men. JILDP successwith gender and HR mainstreaming may be attributed in part to the effectiveness of individuals in key positions within the project team (international gender specialist, human rights advisor and national human rights specialist) to serve as drivers of change. In addition a culture of performance and strong management of UNDP and UNWOMEN ensured that despite the complexities the project activities were delivered and were of high quality. The JILDP can be credited for creating a confidence among national authorities a feeling that decentralisation is feasible despite the complexities.

5.2 Recommendations

1. Continue support in the area of policy, regulatory coherence, and sector strategies selectively.

Implementing the decentralization strategy is the better way of service provision and there should be no going back now.The action plan to implement the decentralization strategy is relevant and should be implemented over a period of time. However, the project does not have the resources to support the government in all areas of the action plan. Neither does it have the resources to help the government implement the options that it puts forward for its consideration.To this end, the project should be very selective in its technical support for policy and strategy development. A number of key local service sectors should be selected and sectoral policy documents elaborated. Studies should be initiated only in correlation with the necessary institutional support and resources to implement the options/recommendations of the study.

2. Critically provide support for fiscal decentralization for ensuring that the new strategy of giving responsibility to LPAs is supported by predictable resources.

Fiscal decentralization is a critical area for priority implementation if the decentralization reform should have its intended effect and be sustainable. Providing power to municipalities without providing them the resources to carry out their new responsibilities only leads to apathy and frustration.The government must be encouraged through policy dialogue to speed up implementation of the fiscal decentralization despite obstacles of budget, law, etc. The government should also be given technical support in the implementation and monitoring of the fiscal decentralization.Five essential areas for fiscal decentralization are: i.) transparency, ii.) predictable and expanded funding directly to the 1st level of the LPAs, iii.) changing the policies to ensure that local governments' own revenue potential is fully utilized, iv.) changing the equalization system that dis-incentives local governments from generating more revenues, and v.) monitoring and evaluation of the fiscal decentralization, and vi) improve local government budgeting and financial management skills and practices to allow for accountable and efficient management of the new powers and resources. There is always doubt about the LPAs to budget and account to the finance ministry responsibly. However, if they are never allowed to manage their own finances independently,the LPAs will never learn.

3. Set up a governmental system to implement and monitor the decentralization strategy.

Central government needs a strong capacity to manage the reform and adapt it to the changing conditions. To this end, the Parity Commission, the Decentralization Policies Division in the State Chancellery and the Ministry of Finance need targeted, substantive, and sustained support. Without empowered political oversight and monitoring, the newly approved decentralization strategy might lose its initial enthusiasm and implementation momentum. An option would be to use existing institutional mechanisms and create a partnership between the Parliamentary Committee on Decentralization and the Congress of Local Public Authorities of Moldova (CALM) for monitoring implementation of the decentralization process.As the country's only unified local government association

representing 500 LPAs, CALM has the ability to help the Parliamentary Committee collect information to assist in its oversight.

4. Support establishment of e-governance for LPAs

The Government of Moldova has been working to promote e-governance and ICT platforms to ensure open government and greater engagement of citizens in government policies and establish a robust service delivery mechanism. Successful pilot has been created with the support of UNWOMEN on establishing a e-governance system at the level of LPA. Such ongoing work should be linked to implement the newly approved decentralization policy and service deliver at the local level. E-government and open government can support decentralization by ensuring:

- Greater access of vulnerable groups and marginalised communities (men and women) to service delivery mechanisms.
- Improved capabilities of the duty bearers (supply side) in implementing policies on the ground and ensuring service delivery.
- Development of capacities of the rights holders, i.e., the poor and the marginalized, including people in need of social protection such as those with disabilities (PWD).

5. Pilot inter-municipal cooperation projects and show the way forward for consolidation of LPAs.

Thanks to initial work conducted already under JILDP, inter-municipal cooperation is appreciated as a tool for improving efficiency and effectiveness of service delivery.The current legislation allows for pilots of several forms of inter-municipal cooperation for various priority sectors (e.g. education, social protection, energy efficiency, water, and solid waste). UNDP has considerable experience in the region in supporting implementation of IMC (Macedonia, Montenegro, Ukraine). As there is so much work to be done, other development partners can be involved and this work should be coordinated.A good start is the joint conference organized by GIZ (Modernization of Local Public Service in the Republic of Moldova), USAID (Local Government Support Program) and UNDP/UN Women (JILDP).Community projects should also be introduced through inter-municipal cooperation project.The criteria and logic of clustering communities for inter-municipal projects should be well thought through before any action is taken.

6. Using lessons learnt from existing approaches and models, develop a model of vulnerability approach to community projects that can be easily scalable and replicablefor the next phase of the project.

The project should continue to deepen understanding of how social exclusion and vulnerability influences local planning and development processes in line with its current direction.It is incumbent on the project to recognize and learn from the differences in the three models of community empowerment piloted by JILDP.All of the models had merit and sound theoretical backing; all sought to integrate gender and human rights principles; and all followed understandable reasoning given the local context and constraints inherent in the project design.While the 'intensive' approach yielded better results in transforming communities and facilitating meaningful participation of vulnerable groups, the 'streamlined' and 'Transnistrian' approaches also developed local capacities to take into account gender and human rights in community processes.Models utilized different funding modalities, and required different investments in terms of time and human resources, offering valuable comparative data that should be fully analyzed at the close of the project cycle. The next phase of the project must bring together different funding and management modalities that draw on the collective JILDP pilot experiences to assemble a single methodological framework for inclusive community empowerment.

7. **Consolidate gender and HRBA models and concepts and incorporate it into all components of the next phase of the project.**

The project stands out in many ways because of the central attention given to operationalizing gender mainstreaming and HRBA.The tools and system generated by the project on gender and HRBA are innovative and instructional. The project should consolidate all efforts and models in gender mainstreaming and HRBA and design easy to implement models (for scalability and ease to replicate). The JLDP and its key partners the Government, UNDP, UN WOMEN have demonstrated that better results can be achieved by incorporating gender and HRBA at all levels and all activities of a decentralization strategy.